

Redmine - Defect #10673

Dot and comma in wiki pagename

2012-04-16 11:10 - Alexander Oryol

Status: New	Start date:
Priority: Normal	Due date:
Assignee:	% Done: 0%
Category: Wiki	Estimated time: 0.00 hour
Target version:	Affected version:
Resolution:	
Description RFC 1738 Uniform Resource Locators (URL) in part 2.2 said: "Thus, only alphanumerics, the special characters "\$-_.+!*()'", and reserved characters used for their reserved purposes may be used unencoded within a URL." But Redmine code disallow commas and dots in wiki page title. Why? Which reason for it?	
Related issues: Related to Redmine - Defect #45: Wiki names can't have periods in them Closed	

History

#1 - 2012-04-16 12:25 - Alexander Oryol

- File *dot-comma.patch* added

The patch.

#2 - 2012-04-16 14:50 - Etienne Massip

See [#45](#) and [r463](#) at the origin of the removal of period in wiki page name.

#3 - 2012-04-16 17:08 - Alexander Oryol

- File *commas.patch* added

Yes, it is potentially conflict with rails ".format" feature.
Patch updated for commas-allow.

#4 - 2012-04-17 08:46 - Alexander Oryol

- File *comma_allow.patch* added

Patch updated. In routes.rb: needn't more :requirements => { :id => /.*/ }

#5 - 2013-01-27 17:09 - Valery Bulash

Someone - please, update these patches to 2.2.1-stable.
Evidently, routes.rb changed so much since that April'2012.

#6 - 2016-07-08 15:17 - Zer Guz

+1 We need dots to be allowed. We have wiki pages that correspond to project versions and would like to call these the same.

#7 - 2017-03-29 22:55 - Vladimir Perepechenko

+1 We need dots to be allowed. We have wiki pages that correspond to project versions

#8 - 2020-10-14 15:06 - Alex Moroz

+1 We need dots to be allowed. We have wiki pages that correspond to project versions

#9 - 2021-08-28 11:57 - T. Peter

+1 We need dots to be allowed. We have wiki pages that correspond to project versions
Same here

#10 - 2022-09-29 11:36 - Jonathan Riedmair

+1 We need dots to be allowed. We have wiki pages that correspond to project versions

#11 - 2025-05-12 14:25 - Luc Luc

- *File allow-dots-and-commas-in-wiki-page-names.patch added*

Please find attached a patch for version 6.0.5 stable.

#12 - 2025-05-12 15:05 - Holger Just

Thank you for your work on this.

However, Redmine sometimes uses extensions at Wiki page URLs to denote various exported formats for the same resource. By appending .txt to the URL of a page for example. you can get the raw textile or markdown for the page. By appending .html, you can get a simple rendered version of the page without much additional markup. There several other possible extensions in use for exports and for the REST API.

By ensuring that the actual wiki page identifier can not contain a dot, the URLs are guaranteed to be unambiguous. After this patch however, it is possible to have ambiguous URLs, e.g. if you would have a wiki page called welcome and another called welcome.txt, it's not clear what should happen if the welcome.txt page is requested.

With just your patch, these wiki pages would break in any case. A possible workaround could be to disallow some named extensions. However, I don't believe that this is a good idea as it may result in previously valid wiki pages to become invalid if we introduce additional export extensions in the future, or it may force us (and all plugin authors) to stick to the extensions we have now without being able to add further functionality in the future, neither of which is an appealing option.

As such unfortunately, I believe that we can't properly support the use of a dot in wiki page titles at all given the current URL structure used by Redmine. Accordingly, I'm voting to close this issue as "won't fix" without merging the patch.

As a workaround, you may be able to use a underscore character (`_`) instead of a dot in wiki page titles.

#13 - 2025-05-12 15:19 - Luc Luc

Holger Just wrote in [#note-12](#):

Thank you for your work on this.

Thank you for taking the time to look at it.

However, Redmine sometimes uses extensions at Wiki page URLs to denote various exported formats for the same resource. [...]

Please accept my apologies for not properly investigating the possible side effects first and also for taking so much from your time to explain in detail the problems my patch is causing.

As such unfortunately, I believe that we can't properly support the use of a dot in wiki page titles at all given the current URL structure used by Redmine. Accordingly, I'm voting to close this issue as "won't fix" without merging the patch.

Absolutely understandable, I'm sorry again for the noise.

As a workaround, you may be able to use a underscore character (`_`) instead of a dot in wiki page titles.

I used the dot exclusively for wiki page names containing version information (e.g. "Version X.X.Z"). Considering your suggestions I will think about another approach.

Thank you again.

#14 - 2025-05-14 15:18 - Holger Just

As for commas, I think they could technically be allowed in URLs. However, this would also require to at least adapt the `parse_wiki_links` method in `application_helper` as well as the `include` macro. I'm not sure if there would be any further side-effects there.

As a comma seems to be a rather obscure character in a wiki page title, I'm not sure if that change would be worth the possible compatibility issues which could be arising from this change if not all places are updated...

As such, I would still upload my "Won't Fix" vote for this entire issue.

#15 - 2025-05-14 16:10 - Luc Luc

Disclaimer: I have close to nothing experience with the Redmine source code, I just do small hacks here and there to adapt it to my usage.

I uploaded my patch hoping it may help some people looking for dots (and commas) support in page names, but now I think it was a mistake, causing too much hassle considering all the implications you mentioned.

After your insights, for my own usage, after grep-ing a bit (without knowing for sure what I'm really looking for), I adapted the patch to work around the "export format" concept you mentioned above, but still allowing me to use dots in wiki page names. It is probably a horrific hack, e.g.:

```
diff --git a/app/controllers/wiki_controller.rb b/app/controllers/wiki_controller.rb
index 36b90da77..fff1474ed 100644
--- a/app/controllers/wiki_controller.rb
+++ b/app/controllers/wiki_controller.rb
@@ -353,8 +353,21 @@ class WikiController < ApplicationController
   render_404
 end

+ def dummy_fix_format
+   if params[:id].nil?
+     return
+   end
+   accepted_formats = [".pdf", ".html", ".txt"]
+   ext = File.extname(params[:id])
+   if accepted_formats.include? ext
+     params[:format] = ext[1..-1]
+     params[:id] = File.basename(params[:id], ext)
+   end
+ end
+
+ # Finds the requested page or a new page if it doesn't exist
+ def find_existing_or_new_page
+   dummy_fix_format
+   @page = @wiki.find_or_new_page(params[:id])
+   if @wiki.page_found_with_redirect?
+     redirect_to_page @page
@@ -363,6 +376,7 @@ class WikiController < ApplicationController

  # Finds the requested page and returns a 404 error if it doesn't exist
  def find_existing_page
+   dummy_fix_format
    @page = @wiki.find_page(params[:id])
    if @page.nil?
      render_404
    end
  end
end
```

That's definitely not "production quality code" :-) but now the PDF, HTML and TXT exports and the dotted page names seems to work for my use case.

Probably I broke something else, but so far I didn't encountered any issues.

I didn't touch `parse_wiki_links`, I guess probably the required changes are already contained in `Wiki.titleize` (the corresponding regular expression already being touched by the patch). Regarding the include `macro`, I don't even know what that means.

Anyway, long story short, in my opinion you shouldn't take my patch too seriously and you shouldn't spend too much time trying to please dot worshipers if the intricacies of Redmine design are not really compatible with the "dot in page name" idea.

"Won't Fix" vote works for me.

Files

dot-comma.patch	3.69 KB	2012-04-16	Alexander Oryol
commas.patch	4.59 KB	2012-04-16	Alexander Oryol
comma_allow.patch	2.27 KB	2012-04-17	Alexander Oryol
allow-dots-and-commas-in-wiki-page-names.patch	4.79 KB	2025-05-12	Luc Luc