

Redmine - Feature #10989

Prevent parent issue from being closed if a child issue is open

2012-05-22 10:46 - ravi jain

Status:	Closed	Start date:	
Priority:	Normal	Due date:	
Assignee:	Jean-Philippe Lang	% Done:	0%
Category:	Issues	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:	3.4.0		
Resolution:	Fixed		
Description			
I am able to close a parent issue while its Child issues are yet not closed/rejected, ideally it should not let a use to close a Parent issue, until all it's child issues are not closed.			
Related issues:			
Related to Redmine - Feature # 13585: Make sub-task inherit the properties of...		New	
Related to Redmine - Defect # 27974: Issue-state can't set to done if state o...		Closed	
Related to Redmine - Feature # 28492: Close sub-tasks when closing a parent task		New	
Duplicated by Redmine - Feature # 12956: Warning "parent issue is closed"		Closed	
Duplicated by Redmine - Feature # 18212: The status of parent issue could be ...		Closed	
Duplicated by Redmine - Feature # 5462: Blocking issues to be closed which ha...		Closed	2010-05-07

Associated revisions

Revision 16108 - 2016-12-21 10:09 - Jean-Philippe Lang

Prevent parent issue from being closed if a child issue is open (#10989).

History

#1 - 2012-05-25 19:18 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Tracker changed from Defect to Feature

- Subject changed from Parent issue can be closed, while it's child issues are still open to Prevent parent issue from being closed, while it's child issues are still open

- Assignee deleted (Azamat Hackimov)

- Priority changed from High to Normal

#2 - 2014-10-28 04:29 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Duplicated by Feature #12956: Warning "parent issue is closed" added

#3 - 2014-10-28 04:31 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Duplicated by Feature #18212: The status of parent issue could be changed to closed before all of the sub issues' status are changed to closed added

#4 - 2015-04-16 08:28 - Ami Desai

+1

#5 - 2016-08-26 02:11 - Go MAEDA

I think the behavior is logical and this feature is really needed.

#18212 has a patch.

#6 - 2016-08-31 00:55 - Marius BALTEANU

This means also that we shouldn't be able to add to a new/open issue a parent which is already closed?

#7 - 2016-09-20 10:20 - Marius BALTEANU

- *File cant_close_before_sub_issues_closed.patch added*

I made a patch (inspired from #18212) with tests that implements this feature request.

@Go MAEDA, I still think that in order to implement this completely, we should not allow to set for a new/open issue a parent which is already closed. I'm waiting for your feedback (or other Redmine contributors) in order to include also this change in the patch.

#8 - 2016-09-20 14:11 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- *Related to Feature #13585: Make sub-task inherit the properties of parent added*

#9 - 2016-09-20 14:11 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- *Related to deleted (Feature #13585: Make sub-task inherit the properties of parent)*

#10 - 2016-09-20 14:12 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- *Related to Feature #13585: Make sub-task inherit the properties of parent added*

#11 - 2016-09-20 14:13 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- *Duplicated by Feature #5462: Blocking issues to be closed which have open subtasks added*

#12 - 2016-09-20 14:29 - Toshi MARUYAMA

Marius BALTEANU wrote:

| *I made a patch (inspired from #18212) with tests that implements this feature request.*

LGTM.

I have some questions.

What happens if opened child issues which user cannot see (private/visibility)?

error_can_not_close_issue_with_open_subtasks: "An issue with open subtasks cannot be closed"

Would it better "An issue" -> "The issue"?

| *@Go MAEDA, I still think that in order to implement this completely, we should not allow to set for a new/open issue a parent which is already closed. I'm waiting for your feedback (or other Redmine contributors) in order to include also this change in the patch.*

I think this would better in separate issue.

#13 - 2016-09-20 18:05 - Marius BALTEANU

Toshi MARUYAMA wrote:

| *What happens if opened child issues which user cannot see (private/visibility)?*

The user will receive the same error message and I think that is the correct behavior because any open subtask means work to do (from my point of view).

If you have the following scenario:

- Issue with 4 subtasks
- Two are visible to my role
- Other two are visible to another role.

Closing my subtasks doesn't mean that the parent issue can be closed, it means only that I made my piece of work. If you think that it'll be confusing for the users, we can improve the error message.

| *Would it be better "An issue" -> "The issue"?*

I took some internal feedback and the new proposal is "You cannot close an issue with open subtasks.". Let me know what do you think in order to update the patch.

| *@Go MAEDA, I still think that in order to implement this completely, we should not allow to set for a new/open issue a parent which is already closed. I'm waiting for your feedback (or other Redmine contributors) in order to include also this change in the patch.*

| *I think this would be better in a separate issue.*

Agree, I'll open a new issue.

#14 - 2016-10-20 12:20 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Target version set to Candidate for next major release

#15 - 2016-10-20 12:23 - Toshi MARUYAMA

Marius BALTEANU wrote:

| *Let me know what do you think in order to update the patch.*

Please update the patch.

#16 - 2016-10-20 14:53 - Marius BALTEANU

- File `cant_close_before_sub_issues_closed_v2.patch` added

Here it is.

#17 - 2016-11-16 13:15 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Target version changed from Candidate for next major release to 3.4.0

#18 - 2016-12-16 10:13 - Marius BALTEANU

- File `cant_close_before_sub_issues_closed_v3.patch` added

Fixed the expected error message in the test.

#19 - 2016-12-21 10:13 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Subject changed from *Prevent parent issue from being closed, while it's child issues are still open* to *Prevent parent issue from being closed if a child issue is open*
- Status changed from *New* to *Closed*
- Assignee set to *Jean-Philippe Lang*
- Resolution set to *Fixed*

Added in r16108. It prevents a parent task with open subtasks from being closed and a subtask of a closed issue from being reopened (in the same way as blocked issues were currently handled). It also prevents an open issue to be set as a subtask of a closed parent issue.

#20 - 2016-12-21 10:16 - Jean-Philippe Lang

| I took some internal feedback and the new proposal is "You cannot close an issue with open subtasks."

I chose to use "An open issue cannot be attached to a closed parent task" to be consistent with other validation messages (eg. "An issue cannot be linked to one of its subtasks").

#21 - 2016-12-21 10:42 - Marius BALTEANU

Thanks for implementing this. The new error message is fine for me.

#22 - 2018-01-13 01:53 - Go MAEDA

- Related to Defect #27974: *Issue-state can't set to done if state of one subissue is not set to done* added

#23 - 2018-08-07 17:23 - Go MAEDA

- Related to Feature #27864: *Subtasks inherit parent settings during copy* added

#24 - 2018-08-07 17:24 - Go MAEDA

- Related to deleted (Feature #27864: *Subtasks inherit parent settings during copy*)

#25 - 2018-08-07 17:24 - Go MAEDA

- Related to Feature #28492: *Close sub-tasks when closing a parent task* added

Files

<code>cant_close_before_sub_issues_closed.patch</code>	2.79 KB	2016-09-20	Marius BALTEANU
<code>cant_close_before_sub_issues_closed_v2.patch</code>	2.81 KB	2016-10-20	Marius BALTEANU
<code>cant_close_before_sub_issues_closed_v3.patch</code>	2.81 KB	2016-12-16	Marius BALTEANU