Redmine - Defect #123

One user's bad email address breaks all email notifications for everyone on a project

2007-10-08 16:31 - Adam Knight

Status:	Closed	**Start date:**	
Priority:	Normal	**Due date:**	
Assignee:		**% Done:**	0%
Category:	Email notifications	**Estimated time:**	0.00 hour
Target version:			
Resolution:		**Affected version:**	

Description

Because everyone's email address is used in one email, if a mail server rejects the message because one address is bad and it hosts that domain, then no notifications are ever sent for any project that the bad user is a part of.

Example: Say I have A.A, B.B, and C.C @foo.com. If B.B lists his email as B-B@foo.com then the mail server at foo.com (which is the one redmine is using) will reject the address, and thus the message.

Redmine should send one email per addressee rather than one group email OR have the option of sending all notifications for the project to one address so someone can setup a mailing list and then one email to the person that owns the object that generated the notification (an issue's assigned owner, for instance).

Related issues:

Is duplicate of Redmine - Defect #8157: Redmine do not send notification emai...	**Closed**

History

#1 - 2007-12-01 16:26 - Jean-Philippe Lang

> will reject the address, and thus the message.

This is related to your SMTP server.
But it's not a Redmine bug.

#2 - 2007-12-01 18:31 - Adam Knight

No, this isn't a mail server-specific issue. This is standard
for all mail servers
that process mail for a domain. If any recipient in the list
is invalid, the
message is rejected. This is why mailing list servers send messages
out one
at a time. This is why Trac sends them out one at a time. This
is why
Redmine should also be sending them out one at a time.

It's in RFC 821, section 3.1: "If the recipient is unknown
the receiver-SMTP
returns a 550 Failure reply."

This causes the message to fail in its entirety if there's a
bad recipient in the
address list and the server knows it.

Please send out messages one at a time. It's a simple loop. :)

#3 - 2007-12-02 07:50 - Jean-Philippe Lang

> If any recipient in the list is invalid, the message is

rejected.

I'm just trying to understand... If you're right, how do you
explain example 1 in RFC 821, page 5 ?

> This is why Trac sends them out one at a time.

This was the case in 0.9, but not in 0.10.
I've just installed Trac 0.10.3 and I can guarantee that only
one notification is sent for all the recipients (bcc by default).
I think that rubyforge is also doing so.

#4 - 2007-12-02 12:33 - Adam Knight

I'm not saying it's invalid SMTP; it sends the messages more
often than not, so it
must be valid. I'm saying that in the specific case of company
foo.com running
redmine.foo.com and sending mail via mail.foo.com with users
a@foo.com through
z@foo.com that the mail server will be the final destination
for all of the messages.
As such, if someone accidentally uses the address AA@foo.com,
then the mail server
will reject the whole message because it knows that one address
is wrong and
absolutely no one that works with that user will ever get
a notification as a result.

This happens across mail server types, reliably. I've tested
two Postfix servers and
an Exim server on this and it fails every time if just one user's
email is incorrect AND
the server Redmine uses to send the message is the final destination
for that
message. It's not something one can easily fix.

Well, I could turn on soft failures on the server, but then when
the server is
spammed then it'll eat up a ton of resources and that's generally
not good. It would
be much nicer if Redmine had the option of simply firing them
off in a loop so that
one bad address doesn't break things.

#5 - 2008-04-01 13:17 - Thomas Lecavelier

- Status changed from New to Closed

Seem to be related to a SMTP server RFC-ignorant.

Please reopen if this problem is confirmed.

#6 - 2014-07-25 02:13 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Is duplicate of Defect #8157: Redmine do not send notification emails if a recipients email address is not valid added

#7 - 2014-11-24 09:07 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Description updated

- Category set to Email notifications

#8 - 2016-12-02 14:48 - Aleksandar Pavic

+1

I can confirm this bug exists in version:

```
Environment:
  Redmine version                3.0.1.stable.14155
  Ruby version                   2.2.1-p85 (2015-02-26) [x86_64-linux]
  Rails version                  4.2.1
  Environment                    production
  Database adapter               Mysql2
```

```
SCM:
  Subversion                    1.8.8
  Git                           1.9.1
  Filesystem
Redmine plugins:
  agile_dwarf                   0.0.3
  clam                          0.0.1
  clipboard_image_paste         1.10
  redmine_image_clipboard_paste 1.0.0
```

Expected behavior would be to send emails to rest of users related to tasks (creator and watchers)

Dump from my production log, after updating an issue:

```
Started PATCH "/issues/185" for 8.8.8.8 at 2016-12-02 14:44:25 +0100
Processing by IssuesController#update as HTML
  Parameters: {"utf8"=>"", "authenticity_token"=>"MXd6g5H/bF8ZiF2TDabKInfV6Nh/N+pSzbIjo81LZfBl0OdxJ6FIkeA+UM6
QmZB8CujKL5QiNiffWJIpaHKgEQ==", "issue"=>{"is_private"=>"
0", "project_id"=>"20", "tracker_id"=>"5", "subject"=>"Something", "description"=>"Some desc.", "status_id"=>"
3", "priority_id"=>"2", "assigned_to_id"=>"5", "fixed_version_id"=
>"", "parent_issue_id"=>"", "start_date"=>"2016-12-02", "due_date"=>"", "estimated_hours"=>"", "done_ratio"=>"
100", "notes"=>"", "private_notes"=>"0", "lock_version"=>
"4"}, "time_entry"=>{"hours"=>"", "activity_id"=>"", "comments"=>""}, "last_journal_id"=>"116", "commit"=>"Sub
mit", "id"=>"185"}
  Current user: aco (id=3)
  Rendered mailer/_issue.text.erb (4.8ms)
  Rendered mailer/issue_edit.text.erb within layouts/mailer (5.5ms)
  Rendered mailer/_issue.html.erb (2.7ms)
  Rendered mailer/issue_edit.html.erb within layouts/mailer (3.4ms)
Email delivery error: 550 5.1.1 <elliott@someserver.biz>: Recipient address rejected: User unknown in virtual
alias table
```

#9 - 2018-09-10 22:24 - Ken Zalewski

This issue has persisted for years, and is now in the current version, 3.4.6.

It has affected us here at the Senate on multiple occasions when an employee leaves the Senate. That employee's email address is disabled, so any mail sent to that address returns a 550 SMTP error.

This has the end result of preventing ANY notifications from going out on a project where the terminated employee might be a member. This is bad behavior, and it's been reported multiple times.

I am asking that this issue be prioritized. We depend on email notifications working properly, and we don't want project notifications to stop working just because one member on that project/group has a bad email address.

#10 - 2019-06-08 06:18 - Go MAEDA

This problem was fixed by #26791 in Redmine 4.0.0.