

Redmine - Defect #19276

Creating new issues with invalid project\_id should return 422 instead of 403 error

2015-03-05 03:09 - hironemu @

Status:	Closed	Start date:	
Priority:	Normal	Due date:	
Assignee:	Jean-Philippe Lang	% Done:	0%
Category:	REST API	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:	3.0.2	Affected version:	3.0.0
Resolution:	Fixed		
<div>Description</div> <div>Hi,</div> <div>The following REST request worked fine in Redmine 2.6.0:</div> <div><pre>\$ curl -v -H "Content-Type: application/xml" -X POST --data "@test.xml" -u test:testpass https://example.com/issues.xml</pre></div> <div>test.xml</div> <div><pre>&lt;?xml version="1.0" encoding="ISO-8859-1" ?&gt; &lt;issue&gt;   &lt;subject&gt;test&lt;/subject&gt;   &lt;project_id&gt;test_project&lt;/project_id&gt;   &lt;tracker_id&gt;6&lt;/tracker_id&gt;   &lt;description&gt;test&lt;/description&gt; &lt;/issue&gt;</pre></div> <div>Since upgrading to Redmine 3.0.0 the server responds with a HTTP 403 Forbidden. I don't change user's role or other permissions.</div>			
<div>Related issues:</div> <div><div>Related to Redmine - Feature #1003: Allow "New Issue" from anywhere</div><div>Closed2008-04-05</div></div> <div><div>Related to Redmine - Defect #23766: API : creating issues with project identi...</div><div>Closed</div></div> <div><div>Has duplicate Redmine - Defect #20119: REST API: setting project_id in issue ...</div><div>Closed</div></div>			

Associated revisions

Revision 14141 - 2015-03-20 11:02 - Jean-Philippe Lang

API: creating an issue with an invalid project\_id should return 422 instead of 403 (#19276).

Revision 14146 - 2015-03-20 17:27 - Jean-Philippe Lang

Don't render the issue form if issue.project is nil (#19276).

Revision 14150 - 2015-03-21 09:35 - Jean-Philippe Lang

Merged r14141 and r14146 (#19276).

History

#1 - 2015-03-07 08:18 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Status changed from New to Closed
- Resolution set to Wont fix

As you can see on the [API documentation](#), the project\_id attribute must be the numeric id of the project.

#2 - 2015-03-10 12:15 - Aron Rotteveel

That is actually not true. This has always worked. I am also getting 403's after upgrading. As your linked API documentation states:

project\_id: get issues from the project with the given id, where id is either project id or project identifier  
.

#### #4 - 2015-03-11 15:39 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Status changed from Closed to New
- Resolution deleted (Wont fix)

#### #5 - 2015-03-12 21:21 - Alex Last

same here. I installed Redmine 3.0.0 to our test server and tried running Redmine Java API tests against it:

com.taskadapter.redmineapi.NotAuthorizedException: Forbidden. Please check the user has proper permissions.

this worked fine with all previous Redmine versions.

#### #6 - 2015-03-12 21:28 - Alex Last

was "project key" requirement changed to "project numeric ID" somewhere between 2.6.2 and 3.0.0 releases? if yes, can we document this on REST Issue page in Wiki?

#### #7 - 2015-03-12 21:29 - Alex Last

and one other thing: if project ID cannot be parsed then there should be a proper error returned to clients, not "forbidden" - that one is totally misleading.

#### #8 - 2015-03-16 23:48 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Subject changed from Creating new issues through REST API 403 in Redmine 3.0.0 to Creating new issues with invalid project\_id results in 403 error
- Target version set to Candidate for next minor release

Aron Rotteveel wrote:

That is actually not true. This has always worked. I am also getting 403's after upgrading. As your linked API documentation states:

Project identifier can be used as a filter and even if it used to work, it was never supposed to be used as a project\_id value when creating an issue, as you can see in the api tests: [source/trunk/test/integration/api\\_test/issues\\_test.rb](#) or in the [curl example](#). It's consistent with other API endpoints that take a project id (project.parent\_id and time\_entry.project\_id) and consistent with API responses. The API doc should be updated.

and one other thing: if project ID cannot be parsed then there should be a proper error returned to clients, not "forbidden" - that one is totally misleading.

A 422 response would be a better option indeed.

#### #9 - 2015-03-20 11:03 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Subject changed from Creating new issues with invalid project\_id results in 403 error to Creating new issues with invalid project\_id should return 422 instead of 403 error
- Status changed from New to Resolved
- Assignee set to Jean-Philippe Lang
- Target version changed from Candidate for next minor release to 3.0.2
- Resolution set to Fixed

#### #10 - 2015-03-21 09:35 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Status changed from Resolved to Closed

#### #11 - 2015-06-18 08:32 - Alexander Muthmann

Note: the documentation still states

project\_id: get issues from the project with the given id, where id is either project id or project identifier  
which is quite confusing.

#### #12 - 2015-06-29 04:05 - Go MAEDA

- Has duplicate Defect #20119: REST API: setting project\_id in issue not accepted in Redmine 3.0.3 added

#### **#13 - 2015-06-29 04:40 - Go MAEDA**

Alexander Muthmann wrote:

Note: the documentation still states  
[...] which is quite confusing.

Thanks for pointing it out. I have [fixed](#) the document.

project\_id: get issues from the project with the given id (a numeric value, not a project identifier).

#### **#14 - 2015-07-29 04:02 - Mischa The Evil**

- Related to Feature #1003: Allow "New Issue" from anywhere added

#### **#15 - 2016-11-23 10:31 - Go MAEDA**

- Related to Defect #23766: API : creating issues with project identifier no longer possible added