

## Redmine - Defect #22977

### A project member has no access and gets no notification, when being a watcher of the issue

2016-06-03 17:03 - Milan Brabec

<b>Status:</b>	New	<b>Start date:</b>	
<b>Priority:</b>	Normal	<b>Due date:</b>	
<b>Assignee:</b>		<b>% Done:</b>	0%
<b>Category:</b>	Email notifications	<b>Estimated time:</b>	0.00 hour
<b>Target version:</b>		<b>Affected version:</b>	3.2.2
<b>Resolution:</b>			
<b>Description</b>			
<p>Hi, I have an issue, where not other help was effective (public help, wiki, forum). In Redmine 3.2.2 (Czech localization) I have problem using watchers functionality and notifying them when an issue changes. We have a non-public project called "Ukoly" and a role called "Zadavatel". User "milanb" (me) created a task assigned to himself and added a watcher (user "londruj"). User "londruj" is a member of "Ukoly" with a role "Zadavatel" - see <i>screenshot1.png</i> attached. Role "Zadavatel" has all available Redmine rights - see <i>screenshot2.png</i>. Notification for the user "londruj" is set. When the issues changes, the user "londruj" does not get any notification. When accessing the give issues using a direct link, the user "londruj" gets 403 error.</p>			
<b>Related issues:</b>			
Related to Redmine - Patch #16133: Available watchers on new issue form inclu...		<b>Closed</b>	
Related to Redmine - Feature #13512: Add a way to make specific issues visibl...		<b>Closed</b>	
Related to Redmine - Feature #8488: Create an 'Involve' mechanism to private ...		<b>New</b>	
Related to Redmine - Patch #33329: Improve watchers functionality to mark the...		<b>Closed</b>	

## History

### #1 - 2016-06-14 14:51 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Status changed from New to Closed
- Resolution set to Duplicate

Duplicate of #21260.

### #3 - 2016-06-14 15:15 - Milan Brabec

- Status changed from Closed to Reopened

Hi Toshi, I am sorry for reopening this issue, but the problem I have described, is not the same as in #21260. It covers two problems in fact:  
1) I am happy, that I can add a user as a watcher, even if such a user is not a member of that project. The problem is, that such a user gets no notification then.  
2) Even if I add a user, who IS a member of that project, as a watcher, such a user still can not see the issue and gets no notification either.  
Thanks for understanding.  
Milan

### #5 - 2016-06-14 16:10 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Status changed from Reopened to Closed
- Resolution changed from Duplicate to Invalid

Please use forum for question.

### #6 - 2016-06-14 17:59 - Milan Brabec

Believe me, I have tried forum and help before creating this issue. I have also tested all possible configuration options. However, without any success. I still do not understand, what is it good for to give someone a chance to be a watcher, when his role gives no permission to a given issue.

1. It is not the same problem as in #21260, because I am talking about a user, who IS a member of the project.
2. It is much more like patch [#16133](#), which I agree with (The proposed watchers on the new issue form should be able to at least view issues. Otherwise it would not make sense to add them as watchers.)

And I also add here: Even if the watcher IS member of the project!?!

1. It might be more like feature [#13512](#), but I would not say it is a feature request, because the feature 'to add a watcher' is already there, but the watcher may not see the watched issue, until having a role permission, which gives him an access to that issue anyway.
2. Patch [#14318](#) could be the right solution, but it does not make a sense completely to me to use new role permission for this, as a watcher should watch (read) the issue only not depending on his roles in project.

Thanks for understanding.

**#7 - 2016-06-15 04:08 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Category changed from Issues permissions to Email notifications*
- *Status changed from Closed to New*
- *Resolution deleted (Invalid)*

**#8 - 2016-06-15 09:37 - Wim DePreter**

User "londruj" can only see "Issues created or assigned to user", so being watcher of the issue doesn't give him access (and if user can't access issue, he doesn't get email, so behaviour of Redmine seems OK).

Maybe related to [#8488](#)?

See also Go MAEDA's comment in [#8488#note-159](#):

The following is Jean-Phillippe Lang's comment from [#7412#note-13](#):

watchers were designed for notification purpose only. A user who unwatches a private issue would lost access to it. It may be quite confusing for many users.

**#9 - 2016-06-15 11:57 - Milan Brabec**

Thanks a lot for commenting on that, I am aware of the fact, that watching does not give access to an issue. The problem in our situation is, that the user gets no notification email at all. Moreover, what sense does it make to be a watcher, when you can not watch? :-)

I have also read the [#8488](#) and we will probably try the `allow_watchers_and_contributors_access_to_issues_3.2.0` patch as soon as we find out, how to do it properly. Thanks again.

**#11 - 2016-07-12 16:16 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Related to Patch #16133: Available watchers on new issue form include users who cannot even view issues added*

**#12 - 2016-07-12 16:17 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Related to Feature #13512: Add a way to make specific issues visible to a user added*

**#13 - 2016-07-12 16:18 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Related to Feature #8488: Create an 'Involve' mechanism to private issues added*

**#14 - 2016-11-28 10:36 - Milan Brabec**

Hi again, I have double-checked this behaviour in version 3.3.1 too. Is it a chance to confirm this issue? Thanks.

**#15 - 2018-01-24 09:42 - Joaquim Homrighausen**

I still think SEEING the issue and being NOTIFIED on issue updates are two completely separate things. Being able to add the issue creator (via e-mail) as a watcher for him/her to receive notifications that something has changed/happened on the issue that he/she reported is quite vital. Whether or not he/she should be able to see the issue is a separate matter.

**#16 - 2018-01-24 09:50 - Milan Brabec**

Well, I see the difference between SEE and BE NOTIFIED, no doubt. What is the expected behaviour? To see (might be expected, when the verb WATCH was used), or get notified?

**#17 - 2018-05-19 16:38 - Lara R**

Milan Brabec wrote:

Well, I see the difference between SEE and BE NOTIFIED, no doubt. What is the expected behaviour? To see (might be expected, when the verb WATCH was used), or get notified?

Hi Milan,

I am experiencing the same problem with watchers that you reported some time ago. Did you manage to make watchers be able to see the issues?. I found the `allow_watchers_and_contributors_access_to_issues_3.2.0` patch but could not be able to install it.

Did you find out how to do it?

Thanks in advance.

**#18 - 2018-05-21 10:45 - Milan Brabec**

Hi Lara, I have succeeded with following patch:

`23546-watched_or_created_or_assigned_issue_visibility.patch`

Using this one, the watchers have access to watched issues, but certain setup is required after applying the patch.

I have created a new role "Watcher" with some explicit permissions for issues (like view issues, add/edit comments) and used "Issues watched by, created by or assigned to the user" in visibility section.

**#19 - 2020-04-20 16:27 - Marius BĂLTEANU**

- Related to Patch #33329: Improve watchers functionality to mark the users that are watching a non visible object and to not return watchers that cannot see the object added

**Files**

---

screenshot1.PNG	76 KB	2016-06-03	Milan Brabec
screenshot2.PNG	76.2 KB	2016-06-03	Milan Brabec