Redmine - Feature #2481

Improved issue update (+post real-life project information).

2009-01-09 16:45 - Jens Berlips

Status:	New		**Start date:**	2009-01-09
Priority:	Normal		**Due date:**	
Assignee:			**% Done:**	0%
Category:	Issues		**Estimated time:**	0.00 hour
Target version:				
Resolution:				

Description

Hello, Thanks for an excellent project management system.

We have worked with Redmine for a 2 month project now, and it ended a few days ago. I wanted to share some ups and downs and also make a suggestion which I feel could add some real value:

We developed 5 applications, 3 mobile apps and 2 client apps.

How we worked:

- No emails between providers/workers. Only updates within Redmine.
- One project, versions were actually used (faulty) as subprojects (which worked though..).
- Decentralized organization (spread over the world (Sweden, Ukraine, India etc.).

Ups:

- Excellent user interface.
- Easy to understand (even for non-specialists).
- Very easy to update
- Manage plenty of projects is more or less a dealbreaker compared to Trac.
- Excellent admin system.

Downs:

- Grouping of issues is much nicer in Trac, and this is really valuable. For example [Trac version](#) This has no real currently comparison in Redmine
- If you use a project with many subprojects, you cannot really have a good overview, in terms of how versions are represented with bars etc.
- Issues really get bloated in our way of working, it become more of a chat room (SEE BELOW).
- Would be really good to have group permissions on issue level.
- In general, the better we could visualize issues (to get an overview) and their progress the better.

PROPOSAL:

- Currently the update is just a linear list of updates, in one category.

- It would be really good if we could separate this in two parts (or perhaps more?).
    - one part keeping the current , where the updates are more to make actual updates of the issue (time-log, concrete updates etc).
    - another part could be a discussion forum (similar to "forum") where you discuss the issue and how you could deliver it. Driving work and delivery forward.

This will make the issue update process much easier to follow. And the forum could potentially be used for building a best-practice database (Knowledge base, FAQ and similar).

What do you guys think about this?

Thanks again!

Best regards,
Jens Berlips

History

#1 - 2009-01-09 23:20 - Eric Davis

> another part could be a discussion forum (similar to "forum") where you discuss the issue and how you could deliver it. Driving work and delivery forward.

There is a forum module included that could have worked for this.

#2 - 2009-01-09 23:35 - Jens Berlips

Eric Davis wrote:

> There is a forum module included that could have worked for this.

Yes, but as far as I know, there is no way to couple the forum to a issue, or how can this be done? I see more or less the current forum "embedded" into the issue page.

#3 - 2009-01-16 06:17 - Ewan Makepeace

+1

I have similar problems. Redmine is great for managing many fine grained and well defined tasks, but where we need to collaborate to design a solution it comes up short. It **looks** as if it has everything we need:

1. A Forum Module
2. A Wiki
3. An Issue tracker

But none of these tools is quite the answer in these cases:

1. The forum module is weak (compared to any other forum software - probably Redmine's weakest module) and so not popular with my users.
2. The Wiki we use for documentation, but is harder to have a conversation on. It is also cumbersome to embed screenshots (have to save, upload a file and then edit again to link to the file?)
3. Issues tend to become the defacto point of discussion but as mentioned they get rather long, and cluttered.

I am not saying any of these modules is broken, just that whenever we hit a request that needs some thought and discussion, there is no clear venue within Redmine to host that discussion, and no definitive way to link a bunch of resulting new issues to that discussion once the path forward is agreed.

#4 - 2009-02-17 06:41 - Andrew Chaika

Maybe files upload can be done with SWFUpload? http://code.google.com/p/swfupload/

#5 - 2010-03-10 09:41 - Oshyan Greene

This echoes some thoughts I have based on my own experiences. The idea of attaching a forum thread to an issue is interesting and is similar to another feature request I was about to make, which is the ability to attach a discussion thread to a wiki page. Extending it to issues as well is a great idea.