

## Redmine - Feature #6269

### RedCloth 4 support

2010-09-02 05:09 - Jean-Baptiste Barth

<b>Status:</b>	New	<b>Start date:</b>	
<b>Priority:</b>	Normal	<b>Due date:</b>	
<b>Assignee:</b>		<b>% Done:</b>	0%
<b>Category:</b>	Text formatting	<b>Estimated time:</b>	0.00 hour
<b>Target version:</b>			
<b>Resolution:</b>			
<b>Description</b>			
Adding support for Redcloth 4 would be nice since Redcloth 3.x is clearly outdated and has many bugs and limitations.			
But we have to make some choices before integrating this :			
<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Redcloth 4.x needs native compiling, which could be problematic, especially for Windows users. What should we do :<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>try to find how we could make installation easier, and try to switch from redcloth3 to redcloth4</li><li>integrate redcloth4 support as an extra feature (like OpenID authentication: redmine behavior would depend on the presence of a system gem) ? Cons: duplicated testing / things to maintain</li><li>just add this as a "core plugin" ?</li><li>write our own (light) textile parser for the core and drop all this into plugins ?</li></ul></li><li>when ? which target version ?</li><li>if we decide to stay on redcloth3, pros/cons ? is there something we can do to bypass actual limitations (use of light mode in activity summaries, hard_breaks related problems, handling of pre/code/@ sections,...)</li><li>does anyone know good alternatives to redcloth ?</li></ol>			
I leave a tiny patch which basically just let you boot a redmine trunk instance with your system's redcloth 4.2 gem. Basic formatting works but there are many broken tests. I can work on it, but I'd prefer we answer questions above before.			
<b>Related issues:</b>			
Related to Redmine - Feature #10078: Definition List support	New	2012-01-27	
Related to Redmine - Defect #8055: Links ending with curly brackets are not c...	New	2011-04-04	
Related to Redmine - Defect #6376: Turning off textile inline with '==' doesn...	Reopened	2010-09-12	
Related to Redmine - Feature #10889: Add support for the 'tel' URL protocol h...	New		
Related to Redmine - Defect #10758: Sub-/superscript w/o blank	New		
Related to Redmine - Defect #14038: Ordered/unordered lists inside table cell...	Reopened		
Related to Redmine - Defect #16149: Textile within-word markup doesn't work	New		
Related to Redmine - Defect #6796: Long Description Causes 100% CPU on Windows	Closed	2010-11-02	
Related to Redmine - Defect #20425: fn1. not working in tickets	Closed		
Related to Redmine - Defect #29746: Unexpected results with enumeration forma...	New		
Related to Redmine - Feature #20511: Comments for Textile text formatting	Closed		
Has duplicate Redmine - Feature #6910: Update to new version of textile	Closed	2010-11-16	
Blocks Redmine - Feature #2219: Export to LaTeX using Redcloth 4	New	2008-11-20	
Blocks Redmine - Defect #7533: Inline image alt-text fails due to wiki syntax	New	2011-02-03	

### History

#### #1 - 2010-10-19 07:52 - Mike Stupalov

In my best option would be to leave redcloth3 (as light textile parser), and redcloth4 add as plug-in.

For Windows, can simply include precompiled gem?

does anyone know good alternatives to redcloth?

For textile format i know only 2 implementation: redcloth & <http://textile.thresholdstate.com/>

#### #2 - 2010-11-17 20:03 - Frank Schwarz

Windows uses can get precompiled RedCloth 4 this way:

gem install RedCloth --platform=x86-mswin32-60

I applied the basic\_redcloth4\_support.diff but unfortunately code highlighting stops to work then ([https://redmine.buschmais.com/help/wiki\\_syntax\\_detailed.html#13](https://redmine.buschmais.com/help/wiki_syntax_detailed.html#13))

### #3 - 2011-01-25 13:18 - Brett Patterson

Both versions of RedCloth (3 and 4) suffer some sort of XSS vulnerability; however, there are work arounds which we could put in place to remove such attacks. It deals with the use of :filter\_html and white\_list to allow only the HTML that RedCloth/Textile generates.

Perhaps we can rework the implementation to actually utilize asane sanitization method and get back to using the full power of RedCloth instead of this disabled version.

#### References:

- [Ruby on Rails Guide - Security](#) See § 8.15
- [RoR Security Project - RedCloth](#)

### #4 - 2011-01-25 18:19 - Etienne Massip

There is a pure-ruby version since 4.2.0 but its use is discouraged by its author himself :

Excerpt from <https://github.com/jgarber/redcloth/blob/master/CHANGELOG> :

```
Added a pure-ruby version of the parser for times when you can't compile the C or Java extensions. You should avoid using it if at all possible because it is 32 times slower (and has some other problems, too)! [Jason Garber]
```

### #5 - 2011-04-13 00:36 - Ling Li

It seems that the support for definition list (DL) was added between RedCloth 3.x and 4.x, together with a bunch other improvements. I hope Redmine can add RedCloth 4 support in the next release.

### #6 - 2012-05-05 12:00 - Alexander Oryol

RedCloth 4 is very desired feature.  
up!

### #7 - 2012-06-09 19:47 - Aidin Abedi

+1

### #8 - 2013-01-24 17:44 - Adam Clark

Adding another upvote -- in addition to the new features, RedCloth 4 also has a detailed reference manual (<http://redcloth.org/textile/>). Having spent many hours trying to figure out (and document for my users) which Textile features Redmine supports, I would really appreciate being able to point to something like this.

### #9 - 2013-01-25 11:17 - Etienne Massip

I'm personally waiting for <https://github.com/jgarber/redcloth-parslet> because switching to RC4 would bring some important performance drop.

Upgrading would be a challenge whichever RC version we would upgrade to because of the current mix between original and Redmine specific code.

### #10 - 2013-01-25 14:51 - Jean-Baptiste Barth

Hooking in RedCloth4 is also challenging. I should have updated the issue before, but Redmine specific code to handle shortcuts (issues, commit, docs, etc.), "toc", "include" or macros isn't as easy to integrate in the native version.

[Adam Ross](#) Clark: sure RedCloth doc is pretty complete, but Redmine one is accessible and should do the trick for 99% users. See "?" button in every area, which should open [a little box](#) and optionnally [the full page](#) ; we're open to ideas to improve this doc, tell us if things are missing, if you have criticism about the structure etc. You can open a new ticket for that if you want.

### #11 - 2013-04-26 03:04 - Adam Clark

[Adam Ross](#) Clark: sure RedCloth doc is pretty complete, but Redmine one is accessible and should do the trick for 99% users.

I think it does the trick for 99% of the *time*, but in the end almost every *user* is going to hit a 1% edge case at some point. I don't think it's sensible for Redmine to include exhaustive documentation of Textile, but the fact that there are some excellent Textile docs out there, which are rendered more frustrating than helpful by the fact that large chunks of their content is unusable in Redmine, sort of highlights how far behind the curve the current implementation is.

**#12 - 2013-10-14 09:14 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- Related to Defect #14038: Ordered/unordered lists inside table cell are mangled added

**#13 - 2013-11-15 16:54 - Gergely Nagy**

+1 Definition list support would be really nice

**#14 - 2014-03-12 11:11 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- Related to Defect #16149: Textile within-word markup doesn't work added

**#15 - 2015-04-03 03:38 - Go MAEDA**

- Related to Defect #6796: Long Description Causes 100% CPU on Windows added

**#16 - 2015-07-29 01:51 - Go MAEDA**

- Related to Defect #20425: fn1. not working in tickets added

**#17 - 2015-12-21 15:00 - Anton Statutov**

+1

**#18 - 2016-04-08 12:47 - Nils Grimm**

+1, please Upgrade soon.

**#19 - 2016-05-24 21:25 - Jake Kemme**

Since it looks like there's been no movement on this in 5 years, I've created an initial plugin release that adds a 'Redcloth 4' text formatting option to redmine.

[Redmine Redcloth Plugin](#)

Feel free to try it out. I have not tested all possible renderings in the initial release. I've developed it against redmine 3.1 / 3.2, though it may work with other versions.

**#20 - 2016-08-24 11:37 - Anonymous**

+1

**#21 - 2018-10-09 09:14 - Go MAEDA**

- Related to Defect #29746: Unexpected results with enumeration formatting in Textile added

**#22 - 2021-03-01 09:13 - Go MAEDA**

- Related to Feature #20511: Comments for Textile text formatting added

**Files**

---

basic_redcloth4_support.diff	1.75 KB	2010-09-02	Jean-Baptiste Barth
------------------------------	---------	------------	---------------------