

Redmine - Feature #10989

Prevent parent issue from being closed if a child issue is open

2012-05-22 10:46 - ravi jain

|  |                    |                 |            |
|--|--------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Status:  | Closed             | Start date:     |            |
| Priority:  | Normal             | Due date:       |            |
| Assignee:  | Jean-Philippe Lang | % Done:         | 0%         |
| Category:  | Issues             | Estimated time: | 0.00 hour  |
| Target version:  | 3.4.0              |                 |            |
| Resolution:  | Fixed              |                 |            |
| Description  |                    |                 |            |
| I am able to close a parent issue while its Child issues are yet not closed/rejected, ideally it should not let a use to close a Parent issue, until all it's child issues are not closed. |                    |                 |            |
| Related issues:  |                    |                 |            |
| Related to Redmine - Feature #13585: Make sub-task inherit the properties of ...   |                    | New             |            |
| Related to Redmine - Defect #27974: Issue-state can't set to done if state of...   |                    | Closed          |            |
| Related to Redmine - Feature #28492: Option not to block closing a parent iss...   |                    | New             |            |
| Related to Redmine - Feature #31589: Show warning and the reason when the iss...   |                    | Closed          |            |
| Related to Redmine - Feature #31321: Option not to block closing a parent iss...   |                    | Closed          |            |
| Has duplicate Redmine - Feature #12956: Warning "parent issue is closed"   |                    | Closed          |            |
| Has duplicate Redmine - Feature #18212: The status of parent issue could be c...   |                    | Closed          |            |
| Has duplicate Redmine - Feature #5462: Blocking issues to be closed which hav...   |                    | Closed          | 2010-05-07 |

Associated revisions

Revision 16108 - 2016-12-21 10:09 - Jean-Philippe Lang

Prevent parent issue from being closed if a child issue is open (#10989).

History

#1 - 2012-05-25 19:18 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Tracker changed from Defect to Feature
- Subject changed from Parent issue can be closed, while it's child issues are still open to Prevent parent issue from being closed, while it's child issues are still open
- Assignee deleted (Azamat Hackimov)
- Priority changed from High to Normal

#2 - 2014-10-28 04:29 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Has duplicate Feature #12956: Warning "parent issue is closed" added

#3 - 2014-10-28 04:31 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Has duplicate Feature #18212: The status of parent issue could be changed to closed before all of the sub issues' status are changed to closed added

#4 - 2015-04-16 08:28 - Ami Desai

+1

#5 - 2016-08-26 02:11 - Go MAEDA

I think the behavior is logical and this feature is really needed.

[#18212](#) has a patch.

#6 - 2016-08-31 00:55 - Marius BĂLTEANU

This means also that we shouldn't be able to add to a new/open issue a parent which is already closed?

**#7 - 2016-09-20 10:20 - Marius BĂLTEANU**

- *File cant\_close\_before\_sub\_issues\_closed.patch added*

I made a patch (inspired from [#18212](#)) with tests that implements this feature request.

@Go MAEDA, I still think that in order to implement this completely, we should not allow to set for a new/open issue a parent which is already closed. I'm waiting for your feedback (or other Redmine contributors) in order to include also this change in the patch.

**#8 - 2016-09-20 14:11 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Related to Feature #13585: Make sub-task inherit the properties of parent added*

**#9 - 2016-09-20 14:11 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Related to deleted (Feature #13585: Make sub-task inherit the properties of parent)*

**#10 - 2016-09-20 14:12 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Related to Feature #13585: Make sub-task inherit the properties of parent added*

**#11 - 2016-09-20 14:13 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Has duplicate Feature #5462: Blocking issues to be closed which have open subtasks added*

**#12 - 2016-09-20 14:29 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

Marius BALTEANU wrote:

I made a patch (inspired from [#18212](#)) with tests that implements this feature request.

LGTM.

I have some questions.

What happens if opened child issues which user cannot see (private/visibility)?

```
error_can_not_close_issue_with_open_subtasks: "An issue with open subtasks cannot be closed"
```

Would it better "An issue" -> "The issue"?

@Go MAEDA, I still think that in order to implement this completely, we should not allow to set for a new/open issue a parent which is already closed. I'm waiting for your feedback (or other Redmine contributors) in order to include also this change in the patch.

I think this would better in separate issue.

**#13 - 2016-09-20 18:05 - Marius BĂLTEANU**

Toshi MARUYAMA wrote:

What happens if opened child issues which user cannot see (private/visibility)?

The user will receive the same error message and I think that is the correct behavior because any open subtask means work to do (from my point of view).

If you have the following scenario:

- Issue with 4 subtasks
- Two are visible to my role
- Other two are visible to another role.

Closing my subtasks doesn't means that the parent issue can be closed, it means only that I made my piece of work. If you think that it'll be confusing for the users, we can improve the error message.

Would it better "An issue" -> "The issue"?

I took some internal feedback and the new proposal is "You cannot close an issue with open subtasks.". Let me know what do you think in order to update the patch.

@Go MAEDA, I still think that in order to implement this completely, we should not allow to set for a new/open issue a parent which is already closed. I'm waiting for your feedback (or other Redmine contributors) in order to include also this change in the patch.

I think this would better in separate issue.

Agree, I'll open a new issue.

**#14 - 2016-10-20 12:20 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Target version set to Candidate for next major release*

**#15 - 2016-10-20 12:23 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

Marius BALTEANU wrote:

Let me know what do you think in order to update the patch.

Please update the patch.

**#16 - 2016-10-20 14:53 - Marius BĂLTEANU**

- *File cant\_close\_before\_sub\_issues\_closed\_v2.patch added*

Here it is.

**#17 - 2016-11-16 13:15 - Toshi MARUYAMA**

- *Target version changed from Candidate for next major release to 3.4.0*

**#18 - 2016-12-16 10:13 - Marius BĂLTEANU**

- *File cant\_close\_before\_sub\_issues\_closed\_v3.patch added*

Fixed the expected error message in the test.

**#19 - 2016-12-21 10:13 - Jean-Philippe Lang**

- *Subject changed from Prevent parent issue from being closed, while it's child issues are still open to Prevent parent issue from being closed if a child issue is open*

- *Status changed from New to Closed*

- *Assignee set to Jean-Philippe Lang*

- *Resolution set to Fixed*

Added in [r16108](#). It prevents a parent task with open subtasks from being closed and a subtask of a closed issue from being reopened (in the same way as blocked issues were currently handled). It also prevents an open issue to be set as a subtask of a closed parent issue.

**#20 - 2016-12-21 10:16 - Jean-Philippe Lang**

I took some internal feedback and the new proposal is "You cannot close an issue with open subtasks."

I chose to use "An open issue cannot be attached to a closed parent task" to be consistent with other validation messages (eg. "An issue cannot be linked to one of its subtasks").

**#21 - 2016-12-21 10:42 - Marius BĂLTEANU**

Thanks for implementing this. The new error message is fine for me.

**#22 - 2018-01-13 01:53 - Go MAEDA**

- *Related to Defect #27974: Issue-state can't set to done if state of one subissue is not set to done added*

**#23 - 2018-08-07 17:23 - Go MAEDA**

- *Related to Feature #27864: Subtasks inherit parent settings during copy added*

**#24 - 2018-08-07 17:24 - Go MAEDA**

- *Related to deleted (Feature #27864: Subtasks inherit parent settings during copy)*

**#25 - 2018-08-07 17:24 - Go MAEDA**

- Related to Feature #28492: Option not to block closing a parent issue when it has open subtask(s) added

**#26 - 2019-06-19 07:54 - Go MAEDA**

- Related to Feature #31589: Show warning and the reason when the issue cannot be closed because of open subtasks or blocking open issue(s) added

**#27 - 2019-06-19 07:55 - Go MAEDA**

- Related to Feature #31321: Option not to block closing a parent issue when its subtask is open added

**Files**

|  |         |            |                 |
|--|---------|------------|-----------------|
| cant_close_before_sub_issues_closed.patch    | 2.79 KB | 2016-09-20 | Marius BĂLTEANU |
| cant_close_before_sub_issues_closed_v2.patch | 2.81 KB | 2016-10-20 | Marius BĂLTEANU |
| cant_close_before_sub_issues_closed_v3.patch | 2.81 KB | 2016-12-16 | Marius BĂLTEANU |