Redmine - Defect #19276

Creating new issues with invalid project_id should return 422 instead of 403 error

2015-03-05 03:09 - hironemu @

Status:	Closed		**Start date:**	
Priority:	Normal		**Due date:**	
Assignee:	Jean-Philippe Lang		**% Done:**	0%
Category:	REST API		**Estimated time:**	0.00 hour
Target version:	3.0.2			
Resolution:	Fixed		**Affected version:**	3.0.0

Description

Hi,

The following REST request worked fine in Redmine 2.6.0:

```
$ curl -v -H "Content-Type: application/xml" -X POST --data "@test.xml"  -u test:testpass https://
example.com/issues.xml
```

test.xml

```
<?xml version="1.0" encoding="ISO-8859-1" ?>
<issue>
  <subject>test</subject>
  <project_id>test_project</project_id>
  <tracker_id>6</tracker_id>
  <description>test</description>
</issue>
```

Since upgrading to Redmine 3.0.0 the server responds with a HTTP 403 Forbidden.
I don't change user's role or other permissions.

Related issues:

Related to Redmine - Feature #1003: Allow "New Issue" from anywhere	**Closed**	**2008-04-05**
Related to Redmine - Defect #23766: API : creating issues with project identi...	**Closed**	
Has duplicate Redmine - Defect #20119: REST API: setting project_id in issue ...	**Closed**	

Associated revisions

Revision 14141 - 2015-03-20 11:02 - Jean-Philippe Lang

API: creating an issue with an invalid project_id should return 422 instead of 403 (#19276).

Revision 14146 - 2015-03-20 17:27 - Jean-Philippe Lang

Don't render the issue form if issue.project is nil (#19276).

Revision 14150 - 2015-03-21 09:35 - Jean-Philippe Lang

Merged r14141 and r14146 (#19276).

History

#1 - 2015-03-07 08:18 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Status changed from New to Closed

- Resolution set to Wont fix

As you can see on the [API documentation](#), the project_id attribute must be the numeric id of the project.

#2 - 2015-03-10 12:15 - Aron Rotteveel

That is actually not true. This has always worked. I am also getting 403's after upgrading. As your linked API documentation states:

```
project_id: get issues from the project with the given id, where id is either project id or project identifier
.
```

#4 - 2015-03-11 15:39 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- Status changed from Closed to New

- Resolution deleted (Wont fix)

#5 - 2015-03-12 21:21 - Alex Last

same here. I installed Redmine 3.0.0 to our test server and tried running Redmine Java API tests against it:

> com.taskadapter.redmineapi.NotAuthorizedException: Forbidden. Please check the user has proper permissions.

this worked fine with all previous Redmine versions.

#6 - 2015-03-12 21:28 - Alex Last

was "project key" requirement changed to "project numeric ID" somewhere between 2.6.2 and 3.0.0 releases? if yes, can we document this on REST Issue page in Wiki?

#7 - 2015-03-12 21:29 - Alex Last

and one other thing: if project ID cannot be parsed then there should be a proper error returned to clients, not "forbidden" - that one is totally misleading.

#8 - 2015-03-16 23:48 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Subject changed from Creating new issues through REST API 403 in Redmine 3.0.0 to Creating new issues with invalid project_id results in 403 error

- Target version set to Candidate for next minor release

Aron Rotteveel wrote:

> That is actually not true. This has always worked. I am also getting 403's after upgrading. As your linked API documentation states:

Project identifier can be used as a filter and even if it used to work, it was never supposed to be used as a project_id value when creating an issue, as you can see in the api tests: source:/trunk/test/integration/api_test/issues_test.rb or in the curl example. It's consistent with other API endpoints that take a project id (project.parent_id and time_entry.project_id) and consistent with API responses. The API doc should be updated.

> and one other thing: if project ID cannot be parsed then there should be a proper error returned to clients, not "forbidden" - that one is totally misleading.

A 422 response would be a better option indeed.

#9 - 2015-03-20 11:03 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Subject changed from Creating new issues with invalid project_id results in 403 error to Creating new issues with invalid project_id should return 422 instead of 403 error

- Status changed from New to Resolved

- Assignee set to Jean-Philippe Lang

- Target version changed from Candidate for next minor release to 3.0.2

- Resolution set to Fixed

#10 - 2015-03-21 09:35 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- Status changed from Resolved to Closed

#11 - 2015-06-18 08:32 - Alexander Muthmann

Note: the documentation still states

```
project_id: get issues from the project with the given id, where id is either project id or project identifier
```

which is quite confusing.

#12 - 2015-06-29 04:05 - Go MAEDA

- Has duplicate Defect #20119: REST API: setting project_id in issue not accepted in Redmine 3.0.3 added

#13 - 2015-06-29 04:40 - Go MAEDA

Alexander Muthmann wrote:

> Note: the documentation still states
> [...]
> which is quite confusing.

Thanks for pointing it out. I have [fixed](#) the document.

> project_id: get issues from the project with the given id (a numeric value, not a project identifier).

#14 - 2015-07-29 04:02 - Mischa The Evil

- Related to Feature #1003: Allow "New Issue" from anywhere added

#15 - 2016-11-23 10:31 - Go MAEDA

- Related to Defect #23766: API : creating issues with project identifier no longer possible added