

Redmine - Patch #23980

Replace images with icon fonts

2016-10-04 02:07 - Marius BALTEANU

Status:	New	Start date:	
Priority:	Normal	Due date:	
Assignee:	Jean-Philippe Lang	% Done:	0%
Category:	UI	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:	Candidate for next major release		

Description

Icon fonts have some advantages over the classical images:

- being vector graphics, they are scalable and can be resized without losing quality.
- can be customized directly from CSS (size, colour, etc)
- less HTTP requests to server because they are loaded only with one or a few requests. Now, Redmine make a request for each image.
- some of the current custom themes already use icon fonts (Abacus theme, Minelab, PurpleMine2, our custom theme and I think the theme from plan.io).

We're interested to contribute with a patch that implements the FontAwesome icons, but because there are at least two ways to implement them, we want some feedback before from Redmine contributors and/or users.

1. Using i tags:

Advantages:

- Is the recommended way on their [official page](#)
- We can use all the build-in rules available in the FontAwesome CSS.

Disadvantages:

- it'll be required to add the i elements in views.

2. Only from css

Advantages:

- the views will not be modified

Disadvantages:

- The build-in rules must be reimplemented in the current CSS
- The icons will be defined using their unicode. For example, the fa-pencil icon (similar with the current images for icon-edit) has the unicode f040.

Only for demo purposes, I've attached a patch that replaces the icons from issue page with font awesome icons (using i tags).

Related issues:

Related to Redmine - Feature # 5830: Replace famfamfam icons with the fugue set	New	2010-07-07
Related to Redmine - Feature # 11757: Add support for HDPI screens (retina)	New	
Related to Redmine - Feature # 30229: Optimization: all UI icons collapsed in...	Closed	

History

#1 - 2016-10-04 02:11 - Marius BALTEANU

Marius BALTEANU wrote:

2. Only from css

Advantages: - the views will not be modified

Disadvantages:

- The build-in rules must be reimplemented in the current CSS

- The icons will be defined using their unicode. For example, the fa-pencil icon (similar with the current images for icon-edit) has the unicode f040.

The "disadvantages" word should be after the first advantage. Like is in this comment.

#2 - 2016-10-04 02:19 - Marius BALTEANU

- File font_awesome.png added

Attached a screenshot also.

font_awesome.png

#3 - 2016-10-06 12:31 - Jan from Planio www.plan.io

Hi Marius, thanks for proposing this. I think replacing the current icon set with an icon font is a great idea. As you noticed, we're using Font Awesome for the [new Planio design](#).

Marius BALTEANU wrote:

because there are at least two ways to implement them, we want some feedback

Before implementing our new design, we were discussing this intensively. We decided against using `<i>` tags and in favour of adding new CSS rules, for the following reasons:

- Changing all icons in Redmine to `<i>` tags would be a very large patch touching almost all views in Redmine (as you probably already noticed while preparing your demo patch).
- Using `<i>` tags would require all plugin developers to change plugins as well and there would be a (potentially long) period where plugins would still use the "old" icons while Redmine is already using "new" icons making the overall user experience inconsistent.

Implementing new CSS rules for all icons using Font Awesome, however, would be less of a change to existing Redmine code (we would be able to leave views alone) and would apply to all existing plugins using standard Redmine icons (like edit, delete, etc.) at once, so plugin developers would have few things to change or nothing at all.

To respond to the disadvantages mentioned:

The build-in rules must be reimplemented in the current CSS

I actually see this as an advantage: implementing Icon style can be encapsulated in a defined place within the CSS and does not happen all over the place.

The icons will be defined using their unicode. For example, the fa-pencil icon (similar with the current images for icon-edit) has the unicode f040.

From our experience in working with Font Awesome in our new UI, it isn't much of a problem. The icons can be looked up easily via <http://fontawesome.io/icons/> and we could use CSS comments to note the Font Awesome icon names next to the unicodes.

One sidenote: At Planio, we're using [Rails' Asset Pipeline](#) with Redmine and are thus using [SCSS](#) and the [fontawesome-rails gem](#) which is a tremendous help.

#4 - 2016-10-06 13:45 - Marius BALTEANU

Jan from Planio www.plan.io wrote:

Hi Marius, thanks for proposing this. I think replacing the current icon set with an icon font is a great idea. As you noticed, we're using Font Awesome for the [new Planio design](#).

Marius BALTEANU wrote:

because there are at least two ways to implement them, we want some feedback

Before implementing our new design, we were discussing this intensively. We decided against using <i> tags and in favour of adding new CSS rules, for the following reasons:

- Changing all icons in Redmine to <i> tags would be a very large patch touching almost all views in Redmine (as you probably already noticed while preparing your demo patch).*
- Using <i> tags would require all plugin developers to change plugins as well and there would be a (potentially long) period where plugins would still use the "old" icons while Redmine is already using "new" icons making the overall user experience inconsistent.*

Implementing new CSS rules for all icons using Font Awesome, however, would be less of a change to existing Redmine code (we would be able to leave views alone) and would apply to all existing plugins using standard Redmine icons (like edit, delete, etc.) at once, so plugin developers would have few things to change or nothing at all.

To respond to the disadvantages mentioned:

The build-in rules must be reimplemented in the current CSS

I actually see this as an advantage: implementing Icon style can be encapsulated in a defined place within the CSS and does not happen all over the place.

The icons will be defined using their unicode. For example, the fa-pencil icon (similar with the current images for icon-edit) has the unicode f040.

From our experience in working with Font Awesome in our new UI, it isn't much of a problem. The icons can be looked up easily via <http://fontawesome.io/icons/> and we could use CSS comments to note the Font Awesome icon names next to the unicodes.

Totally agree with you, I'll try to create a patch using only CSS.

One sidenote: At Planio, we're using [Rails' Asset Pipeline](#) with Redmine and are thus using [SCSS](#) and the [fontawesome-rails gem](#) which is a tremendous help.

I know that were some discussions about the Rails' Asset Pipeline (I can't find the ticket now) and enabling this feature is not an option because will add some complexity. If I'm wrong, I'll be very happy to use that gem.

Thanks for your feedback.

#5 - 2016-10-09 12:12 - Marius BALTEANU

- *File use_font_awesome_icons_for_all_elements_that_use_icon_class.patch added*

I've attached a first patch which: - adds the Font Awesome fonts

- replaces the images icons with font awesome icons for all elements that have **icon** and **icon-*** classes

Some observations:

1. Currently, there are some specific programming images for file types like text-x-php, text-x-c, text-x-java and so on. Because FontAwesome doesn't have these types of icons, I see 3 ways to solve this problem:

1.1 use the current images

1.2 use the [generic file code icon](#) provided by FontAwesome for all of these files.

1.3 add [Font-Mfizz](#) which is an extension of FontAwesome icons and provides the required icons.

IMHO, I prefer the second solution because:

- it doesn't add new fonts
- it doesn't require to keep the rules related to background images in **icon** class
- it doesn't require maintenance when a new type of files appears (in this patch I've added a new class named "application-javascript" in order to recognize the javascript files)

2. I'll add separate patches that replaces the current images with FontAwesome icons in other pages like: administration, project overview, etc..

3. In the last patch, I'll remove the unused images.

Any feedback is appreciated.

#6 - 2016-10-10 07:35 - Alexander Meindl

I would prefer the Font-Mfizz solution. It does not require much more server load using it (there are a lot less server requests compared to the background image solution). Main reason for this solutions is, that the usability and the user acceptance would be higher. A lot of technical teams are working with Redmine and SCM, and these people will be certainly happy to see file type specific icons.

#7 - 2016-10-25 15:33 - Toshi MARUYAMA

- *Description updated*

#8 - 2016-11-12 15:24 - Marius BALTEANU

We discussed internally in [Zitec](#) and we are going to implement the solution with Font-Mfizz but for the moment we are waiting for some feedback on issue #24313 because having that ticket committed, it will be much easier for us to implement this one.

#9 - 2016-11-20 05:50 - Go MAEDA

- *Related to Feature #5830: Replace famfamfam icons with the fugue set added*

#10 - 2016-11-20 13:25 - Go MAEDA

- *Target version set to Candidate for next major release*

#24313 has been implemented.

I am looking forward to seeing this feature in 3.4.0. Setting target version to "Candidate for next major release".

#11 - 2016-11-20 14:39 - Marius BALTEANU

Go MAEDA wrote:

#24313 has been implemented.

I am looking forward to seeing this feature in 3.4.0. Setting target version to "Candidate for next major release".

The patch that replaces the images with fa icons is ready, but I want to take some feedback from our users regarding the icons color. Now all the icons have the same color (# 169). Please let me know if you want to test it as it is now.

#12 - 2016-11-29 02:07 - Marius BALTEANU

- File *replace_images_with_fa_icons.patch* added
- File *font-mfizz.zip* added
- File *fonts_folder.png* added

The attached patch (*replace_images_with_fa_icons.patch*) replaces the images for all regular icons (that have the classes "icon icon-*)" with font-awesome icons.

Because the git binary diffs are not supported by the patch command, I wasn't able to add the required fonts as patches, but I've documented below the necessary steps:

1. Create a folder **fonts** in the **public** directory from redmine.
2. Unzip the attached *font-mfizz.zip* in the new **fonts** folder.
3. Because the font-awesome archive is bigger than the maximum allowed size for attachments (600kb), the zip can be downloaded from [here](#). If the official [link](#) is preferred, the fonts must be extracted from the archive (folder **fonts**) to a folder named **font-awesome** in the same folder **fonts** from public directory.

At the end, the fonts folder from public should have 2 directories:

- font-awesome
- font-mfizz

fonts_folder.png

There are still some elements that are using images (like classes *expander*, *asc*, *desc*), but I think that is safer to replace them with FA icons in another ticket (requires more changes). Also, I think the images should be removed in a later major release (for plugins compatibility).

Any feedback on the chosen icons is welcome.

#13 - 2016-11-29 02:11 - Marius BALTEANU

- File *activity_fa.png* added
- File *admin_fa.png* added
- File *issue_fa.png* added
- File *issues_fa.png* added
- File *overview_fa.png* added
- File *projects_fa.png* added
- File *repository_fa.png* added
- File *roadmap_fa.png* added

Some screenshots.

#14 - 2016-11-29 02:40 - Marius BALTEANU

- File *replace_images_with_fa_icons_v2.patch* added

Updated to include a fix for the responsive mode (the left padding is no more required).

#15 - 2016-12-19 22:09 - Marius BALTEANU

Any feedback on this patch? FTR, I tried to create a single patch with all the changes with Subversion too but it didn't work.

#16 - 2016-12-24 08:18 - Go MAEDA

- Assignee set to Jean-Philippe Lang

Screenshots looks nice for me.

Jean-Phillipe, is there any possibility that this patch will be merged?

#17 - 2017-01-21 10:51 - Marius BALTEANU

Jean-Philippe, do you have any feedback on this?

#18 - 2017-01-28 11:31 - Go MAEDA

- Related to Feature #11757: Add support for HDPI screens (retina) added

#19 - 2017-12-30 08:29 - Bernhard Rohloff

This patch is a great improvement to Redmine. It extends the variety of icons available to developers of plugins and Redmine itself. It's a pity that there hasn't been more discussion about this improvement for a year now.

Unfortunately this patch doesn't work anymore.

@Marius BALTEANU is it possible to update this patch to a recent revision of Redmine? I would really love to see this patch applied in version:4.0.0 or version:4.1.0.

+1 for this!

#20 - 2018-01-08 20:17 - Marius BALTEANU

Bernhard Rohloff wrote:

@Marius BALTEANU is it possible to update this patch to a recent revision of Redmine? I would really love to see this patch applied in version:4.0.0 or version:4.1.0.

Sure, I'll try to do it this month (including the update to Font Awesome 5).

#21 - 2018-01-12 14:27 - Taiki I

[GitHub changed from Icon fonts to SVG icons.](#)

Icon fonts is not bad, but I think it will be better if you change to SVG icons.

#22 - 2018-03-13 15:20 - Bernhard Rohloff

Taiki IKEGAME wrote:

[GitHub changed from Icon fonts to SVG icons.](#)

Icon fonts is not bad, but I think it will be better if you change to SVG icons.

This also sounds very interesting to me and seems to be more versatile than icon fonts. It could be nice to load custom icons in a plugin and use them with the same helper method as the core icons. Or just to install a custom icon pack as a plugin. Just a few thoughts. I'm not so well informed about this topic right now. So are there some other opinions about preferring SVG icons over icon fonts?

#23 - 2018-04-12 16:43 - Taiki I

Fontawesome 5 recommends [JS with SVG](#).

Sorry for not checking well.

#24 - 2018-12-16 08:46 - Anonymous

Yey! This asap pls! <https://cdn.discordapp.com/emojis/471854100984758274.png>

+1

#25 - 2018-12-16 16:27 - Marius BALTEANU

- Related to Feature #30229: Optimization: all UI icons collapsed into a single sprite added

#26 - 2018-12-16 16:29 - Marius BALTEANU

Max Johansson wrote:

Yey! This asap pls! <https://cdn.discordapp.com/emojis/471854100984758274.png>

+1

Max, I'll be very happy to update my patch if Jean-Philippe agrees to replace the current icons with FA icons.

#27 - 2018-12-17 00:53 - Anonymous

Marius, <https://cdn.discordapp.com/emojis/468702863795683328.png>

Jean-Philippe, could you please let us know your opinion about this?

#28 - 2019-02-15 18:28 - Anonymous

Marius, maybe it will be easier to update the patch and sneak-commit it with help of Go? Then we could cross fingers and hope that Jean-Philippe might not notice it :D

#29 - 2019-02-16 02:04 - Go MAEDA

Max Johansson wrote:

Marius, maybe it will be easier to update the patch and sneak-commit it with help of Go?

I will not commit such a big change without Jean-Philippe's consent. I never forget that he is the owner of this software and we can use Redmine thanks to him and his many years of efforts.

#30 - 2019-02-16 08:14 - Jan from Planio www.plan.io

Go MAEDA wrote:

I will not commit such a big change without Jean-Philippe's consent. I never forget that he is the owner of this software and we can use Redmine thanks to him and his many years of efforts.

Absolutely agree!

#31 - 2019-02-17 11:30 - Bernhard Rohloff

Basically I agree with Go and Jan. It's not an option to make decisions behind JP's back. As much as I share this opinion I can understand Max's intention. This issue is nearly three years old and no decisions are made. So has anybody a better idea on how to get at least a **yes, no, maybe** from Redmine's kahuna?

#32 - 2019-02-18 15:49 - Anonymous

So has anybody a better idea on how to get at least a yes, no, maybe from Redmine's kahuna?

I guess the only way I could come up with is to bump this ticket with a message mentioning **JPL** and **urgent** to be visible in the **activity log of Redmine.org** next time a commit streak from JPL will occur. And it can be detected with help of #redmine-commits channel on our Discord, but if RSS tracker bot will not logout again (Discord been having problems with bots logging out lately, but they are working on fixing it afaik) and there will be anyone available or online to bump this message in that perfect moment :)

#33 - 2019-02-21 17:27 - Anonymous

Bump! Jean-Philippe, this ticket is ultra-urgent to many, please share your consent.

#34 - 2019-02-21 17:57 - Marius BALTEANU

Max Johansson wrote:

Bump! Jean-Philippe, this ticket is ultra-urgent to many, please share your consent.

Max, let be honest, it is not so ultra-urgent, it is just a nice UI improvement for the core and for the theme developers. I'll update my patch to Font Awesome 5 and then I'll share my thoughts regarding this feature.

#35 - 2019-02-21 17:58 - Marius BALTEANU

But I partially agree, a feedback from Jean-Philippe could be useful to not work in the wrong direction.

Files

font_awesome_icons.patch	15.3 KB	2016-10-04	Marius BALTEANU
font_awesome.png	263 KB	2016-10-04	Marius BALTEANU
use_font_awesome_icons_for_all_elements_that_use_icon_class.patch	399 KB	2016-10-09	Marius BALTEANU
replace_images_with_fa_icons.patch	15 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
font-mfizz.zip	243 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
fonts_folder.png	92.8 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
admin_fa.png	142 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
issue_fa.png	236 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
activity_fa.png	293 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
overview_fa.png	191 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
projects_fa.png	124 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
issues_fa.png	319 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
repository_fa.png	324 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
roadmap_fa.png	211 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU
replace_images_with_fa_icons_v2.patch	15.6 KB	2016-11-29	Marius BALTEANU