Redmine - Feature #30086

Use HTTP status code 403 instead of 401 when REST API is disabled

2018-12-04 02:21 - Go MAEDA

Status:ClosedStart date:Priority:NormalDue date:

Assignee: Go MAEDA % Done: 0%

Category: REST API Estimated time: 0.00 hour

Target version: 4.1.0

Resolution: Fixed

Description

Currently, Redmine returns HTTP status code 401 (Unauthorized) if the REST API feature is disabled.

\$ curl -D /dev/stdout --user admin:admin http://localhost:3000/issues.xml
HTTP/1.1 401 Unauthorized

X-Frame-Options: SAMEORIGIN X-XSS-Protection: 1; mode=block X-Content-Type-Options: nosniff X-Download-Options: noopen

X-Permitted-Cross-Domain-Policies: none

Referrer-Policy: strict-origin-when-cross-origin

Content-Type: application/xml

WWW-Authenticate: Basic realm="Redmine API"

Cache-Control: no-cache

X-Request-Id: 22e77bad-feca-4137-a81e-9df152af8bc2

X-Runtime: 0.019368

Transfer-Encoding: chunked

With the status code 401, users may misunderstand that the login id or password is incorrect. If they access to /issues.xml with a web browser, they will see a basic authentication dialog again and again.

I think it is proper and intuitive to return 403 (Forbidden) instead of 401, like "403 API access is not allowed".

Related issues:

Related to Redmine - Defect #32315: Impossible to validate API key without mo... Closed

Associated revisions

Revision 18055 - 2019-04-10 04:51 - Go MAEDA

Use HTTP status code 403 instead of 401 when REST API is disabled (#30086).

Patch by Yuichi HARADA.

History

#1 - 2018-12-04 02:23 - Go MAEDA

- Description updated

#2 - 2018-12-10 03:20 - Yuichi HARADA

- File 30086-http-status-code-403.patch added

Regardless of whether authentication is valid or not, if you disable the REST API feature it responds with HTTP status code 403(Forbidden). I made a patch, and attach it.

#3 - 2018-12-10 21:28 - Marius BĂLTEANU

I'm in favour of this change.

#4 - 2018-12-18 01:15 - Go MAEDA

- Target version set to 4.1.0

2025-05-09 1/2

Setting the target version to 4.1.0.

#5 - 2019-01-18 01:56 - Go MAEDA

Returning 403 in the situation is consistent. In incoming emails API, MailHandlerController returns 403 if "WS for incoming emails" is disabled. Please see source:tags/4.0.0/app/controllers/mail_handler_controller.rb#L41.

#6 - 2019-02-25 13:34 - Go MAEDA

- File 30086-http-status-code-403-v2.patch added

Removed an unnecessary test_with_valid_username_and_wrong_password_http_authentication from the patch.

#7 - 2019-04-10 04:51 - Go MAEDA

- Status changed from New to Closed
- Assignee set to Go MAEDA
- Resolution set to Fixed

Committed the patch. Thank you.

#8 - 2020-10-25 08:02 - Go MAEDA

- Related to Defect #32315: Impossible to validate API key without modifying anything added

Files

30086-http-status-code-403.patch	3.17 KB	2018-12-10	Yuichi HARADA
30086-http-status-code-403-v2.patch	2.7 KB	2019-02-25	Go MAEDA

2025-05-09 2/2