

Redmine - Feature #35086

Please consider changing the way how 2FA is set up

2021-04-14 01:50 - robert heiler

Status:	Closed	Start date:	
Priority:	Normal	Due date:	
Assignee:		% Done:	0%
Category:	Accounts / authentication	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:			
Resolution:	Invalid		

Description

Hey guys,

I don't want to write too much, so it is not hard for you to handle this issue.

Recently the ruby bug tracker has been changed to require 2FA.

This is a problem for me as I don't have a smartphone, so the change locked me out of the bug tracker.

Anyway - this is not about that; I would like to suggest a few things.

(1) Right now if you click "sign out" you can not sign out because the 2FA wall shows up:

"The administrator requires you to enable two-factor authentication."

This should be different. It should ALWAYS be possible to sign out again. Sure I can use cookies or use another browser, but I logged into my account of ~13 years just now. Now the 2FA wall prevents me from doing anything, including "sign out". This is not good UI.

We should be able to log out (sign out) again.

Anyway this is a smaller part.

(2) The bigger issue is that I don't get any information about WHY 2FA is suddenly used, and who enabled it. Yes, I get it, the site owner did so, but perhaps the site owner was not aware that this will effectively perma-ban some users. Not everyone has a smartphone or can use 2FA. I already explained this on rubygems.org the github issue tracker, that mandatory 2FA means I can no longer use rubygems, so I'd have to remove my account at rubygems.org (whereas at github I could still publish that code, so this is weird...)

Please consider (2), because it means that the admin of a site may accidentally retire people from ruby, without even intending to do so. To me this is a dealbreaker, because it means I can no longer use the official bug tracker of ruby, which then means I can no longer voice my concern

(I don't use emails really ... never liked emails in ~over 20 years...). That means I'd become a second class citizen to ruby, compared to other users, and since I have no intention to accept this, it would effectively mean that I would also abandon ruby in the long run.

Ruby is a great language, but to me mandatory 2FA is not acceptable. While this is not the fault of redmine itself, I think usability wise several things could be improved.

I assume none of you guys so far thought about how this could cause friction and strife, so hopefully the way how 2FA is explained to users can change in the long run. I had slowly collect that information since nothing was announced anywhere! Suddenly from one day to the other I was slapped into the face with that 2FA wall, so perhaps you can understand my frustration here.

Related issues:

Related to Redmine - Defect # 35087: Users without two-factor authentication ...	Closed	
Related to Redmine - Feature # 34070: Allow setting a grace period when forci...	New	
Related to Redmine - Feature # 31920: Require 2FA only for certain user groups	Closed	
Related to Redmine - Feature # 1237: Add support for two-factor authentication	Closed	2008-05-14

History

#1 - 2021-04-14 04:28 - Go MAEDA

- Related to Defect #35087: Users without two-factor authentication enabled cannot sign out when two-factor authentication is required added

#2 - 2021-04-14 04:30 - Go MAEDA

robert heiler wrote:

(1) Right now if you click "sign out" you can not sign out because the 2FA wall shows up:

"The administrator requires you to enable two-factor authentication."

This should be different. It should ALWAYS be possible to sign out again. Sure I can use cookies or use another browser, but I logged into my account of ~13 years just now. Now the 2FA wall prevents me from doing anything, including "sign out". This is not good UI.

We should be able to log out (sign out) again.

I have posted a patch for this: #35087

#3 - 2021-04-14 04:37 - Go MAEDA

I think it is not a problem with Redmine itself that the admin of bugs.ruby-lang.org suddenly set two-factor authentication required, but what do you think should be done to improve Redmine for this?

#4 - 2021-04-19 09:15 - Marius BALTEANU

I think the following two open issues will improve the current 2FA implementation:

- #34070
- #31920

#5 - 2021-04-19 09:16 - Marius BALTEANU

- Related to Feature #34070: Allow setting a grace period when forcing 2FA added

#6 - 2021-04-19 09:16 - Marius BALTEANU

- Related to Feature #31920: Require 2FA only for certain user groups added

#7 - 2021-06-22 23:05 - Marius BALTEANU

- Related to Feature #1237: Add support for two-factor authentication added

#8 - 2021-07-05 06:34 - Go MAEDA

- Status changed from New to Closed
- Resolution set to Invalid

robert heiler wrote:

(1) Right now if you click "sign out" you can not sign out because the 2FA wall shows up:

"The administrator requires you to enable two-factor authentication."

This should be different. It should ALWAYS be possible to sign out again. Sure I can use cookies or use another browser, but I logged into my account of ~13 years just now. Now the 2FA wall prevents me from doing anything, including "sign out". This is not good UI.

Fixed in #35087. Thank you for pointing it out.

(2) The bigger issue is that I don't get any information about WHY 2FA is suddenly used, and who enabled it.

We cannot do anything about this. Please contact admins of <https://bugs.ruby-lang.org/> or consider using a 2FA app that runs on PC.

#9 - 2022-01-24 11:16 - Marius BALTEANU

Some updates:

- #31920 (require 2FA for some groups) is already committed.
- #34070 (2FA grace period) and #35439 (Require 2FA only for administrators) are ready and they will be committed in the following days.

With these options, the 2FA activation process should be easier.