

## Redmine - Defect #35224

### Adding new project impossible with mandatory custom field of type users

2021-05-10 21:35 - Marc Cramer

<b>Status:</b>	New	<b>Start date:</b>	
<b>Priority:</b>	Normal	<b>Due date:</b>	
<b>Assignee:</b>		<b>% Done:</b>	0%
<b>Category:</b>	Projects	<b>Estimated time:</b>	0.00 hour
<b>Target version:</b>		<b>Affected version:</b>	4.1.2
<b>Resolution:</b>			
<b>Description</b>			
Redmine: 4.1.2 Rails: 5.2.4.4 PostgreSQL: 12.5 No Plugins			
I was just hit by this issue, kind of a logical bug:			
I cannot add a new project if there is a mandatory custom field with a user drop-down list, since there are no users initially--but I cannot add users unless the project has been created...			
To reproduce:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Add a custom field to projects</li><li>- Field type: Users</li><li>- Make the field mandatory</li><li>- Try to add a new project</li></ul>			
Expected behaviour:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Find a prefilled list of users in the drop down</li><li>- Able to submit (create new project)</li></ul>			
Current behaviour:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- User list is empty (possibly because the project has no users?)</li><li>- Toggling inheritance of users does not help</li><li>- Cannot submit project because the custom field is still empty but mandatory</li></ul>			
Workaround:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Make custom field optional</li><li>- Add project (with empty user selection)</li><li>- Add users to the project</li><li>- Edit project again and select user from drop down list</li></ul>			
Am I missing something trivial?			
Thanks			

## History

### #1 - 2021-05-11 04:42 - Go MAEDA

Marc Cramer wrote:

Expected behaviour:

- Find a prefilled list of users in the drop down
- Able to submit (create new project)

Current behaviour:

- User list is empty (possibly because the project has no users?)
- Toggling inheritance of users does not help
- Cannot submit project because the custom field is still empty but mandatory

I agree that there is a problem with the current behavior as you pointed out, but if the behavior changed as above, the project will be created with the required custom field blank. This means that fixing this "bug" makes another bug.

## #2 - 2021-05-11 11:44 - Marc Cramer

Go MAEDA wrote:

Marc Cramer wrote:

Expected behaviour:

- Find a prefilled list of users in the drop down
- Able to submit (create new project)

Current behaviour:

- User list is empty (possibly because the project has no users?)
- Toggling inheritance of users does not help
- Cannot submit project because the custom field is still empty but mandatory

I agree that there is a problem with the current behavior as you pointed out, but if the behavior changed as above, the project will be created with the required custom field blank. This means that fixing this "bug" makes another bug.

Yeah, right... Maybe we should then distinguish a bit:

I can imagine a lot of cases (like mine) where it makes sense to select a user from the drop-down list that is just **any** existing user and **unrelated** to the users being assigned to the project.

So, it sounds like this issue is directing us towards a RFE to have a custom field type like 'project member' vs. 'any user'.

In my case I'd need something like a drop-down for 'any user'.

Does that make sense to you?

## #3 - 2021-05-14 14:05 - Marc Cramer

Ok, can we move this into the Open Features list then somehow?

Summary: Custom field 'users' should be split into 'users (project members)' and 'users (all)' since a mandatory user drop-down prevents from adding new projects because there are no users yet.