Redmine - Defect #36969

EmailAddress regex matches invalid email addresses

2022-04-17 09:07 - salman mp

Status:	Closed		**Start date:**	
Priority:	Normal		**Due date:**	
Assignee:	Go MAEDA		**% Done:**	0%
Category:	Accounts / authentication		**Estimated time:**	0.00 hour
Target version:	5.1.0			
Resolution:	Fixed		**Affected version:**	

Description

There is a regex in the EmailAddress class, that matches some invalid email address like these:

```
test,email@example.com
,test@example.com
$test@example.com

class EmailAddress < ActiveRecord::Base
  include Redmine::SafeAttributes

  EMAIL_REGEXP = /\A([^@\s]+)@((?:[-a-z0-9]+\.)+(?:(?:xn--[-a-z0-9]+)|(?:[a-z]{2,})))\z/i
```

May be better to use URI::MailTo::EMAIL_REGEXP instead.

Related issues:

Related to Redmine - Defect #37922: Valid email address is not allowed	**Closed**	
Related to Redmine - Defect #6088: eMail in uncommon formats considered invalid	**Closed**	2010-08-09

Associated revisions

Revision 22332 - 2023-10-07 05:43 - Go MAEDA

Replace custom EMAIL_REGEXP with URI::MailTo::EMAIL_REGEXP for more accurate email validation (#36969).

Patch by Go MAEDA.

History

#1 - 2022-04-18 10:43 - Go MAEDA

- File 36969.patch added

- Category set to Accounts / authentication

- Target version set to 5.1.0

Setting the target version to 5.1.0.

#2 - 2022-04-20 02:44 - Go MAEDA

- File 36969-v2.patch added

Added a test to the patch.

#3 - 2022-04-21 08:44 - Mischa The Evil

- Description updated

This effectively changes EmailAddress::EMAIL_REGEXP from:

```
/\A([^@\s]+)@((?:[-a-z0-9]+\.)+(?:(?:xn--[-a-z0-9]+)|(?:[a-z]{2,})))\z/i
```

to:

```
/\A[a-zA-Z0-9.!\#$%&'*+\/=?^_`{|}~-]+@[a-zA-Z0-9](?:[a-zA-Z0-9-]{0,61}[a-zA-Z0-9])?(?:\.[a-zA-Z0
-9-]{0,61}[a-zA-Z0-9])?)*\z/
```

as URI::MailTo::EMAIL_REGEXP is defined as such in the Ruby source (https://github.com/ruby/ruby/blob/master/lib/uri/mailto.rb#L55).
This definition is effectively a Ruby port[1] of the JavaScript- and Perl-compatible regex example given in the HTML Living Standard:

```
/^[a-zA-Z0-9.!#$%&'*+\/=?^_`{|}~-]+@[a-zA-Z0-9](?:[a-zA-Z0-9-]{0,61}[a-zA-Z0-9])?(?:\
.[a-zA-Z0-9](?:[a-zA-Z0-9-]{0,61}[a-zA-Z0-9])?)*$/
```

Some quick notes on this change:

- it fixes the cases of the first two email address examples, but $test@example.com still matches (and a little search will probably give more edge-cases);
- the current custom regex includes capture groups while URI::MailTo::EMAIL_REGEXP doesn't (which changes the return value in some cases and thus may break plugins that depend on the current value of EmailAddress::EMAIL_REGEXP) e.g.:

```
'test@example.com'.match(EmailAddress::EMAIL_REGEXP)
=> #<MatchData "test@example.com" 1:"test" 2:"example.com">

'test@example.com'.match(URI::MailTo::EMAIL_REGEXP)
=> #<MatchData "test@example.com">
```

- given the previous note, this might be something that should be shipped in a major release (6.0.0) instead of a minor release (5.1.0).

[1] https://github.com/ruby/ruby/blob/master/lib/uri/mailto.rb#L54

#4 - 2022-05-05 09:08 - Go MAEDA

Mischa The Evil wrote:

> - given the previous note, this might be something that should be shipped in a major release (6.0.0) instead of a minor release (5.1.0).

I don't think the change should be delivered in 6.0.0 instead of 5.1.0.

In Redmine, the change of version number from 5.0.0 to 5.1.0 is not a minor release but a major release. For example, when the version number changed from 3.0.0 to 3.1.0 or from 4.0.0 to 4.1.0, many new features were added and some plugins stopped working.

If this change cannot be delivered in 5.1.0 due to plugin compatibility, I am afraid that 5.1.0 can only include a few bug fixes and cannot include any new features.

#5 - 2022-11-13 08:39 - Go MAEDA

- Related to Defect #37922: Valid email address is not allowed added

#6 - 2023-10-07 05:43 - Go MAEDA

- Status changed from New to Closed

- Assignee set to Go MAEDA

- Resolution set to Fixed

Committed the patch in r22332.

#7 - 2024-02-02 01:25 - Go MAEDA

- Related to Defect #6088: eMail in uncommon formats considered invalid added

Files

36969.patch	1.5 KB	2022-04-18	Go MAEDA
36969-v2.patch	1.92 KB	2022-04-20	Go MAEDA