Roles of a project member should not be made empty

A project member must have one or more roles. If you attempt to add a project member without roles, you will see an error "Failed to save member(s): Role cannot be empty".

However, in Redmine 5.0.1, member roles can be emptied with the following procedure.

1. Add a new member to a project with any roles
2. After adding a role, click "Edit" for the member role
3. Clear the checkbox for each role and click "Save"

In Redmine 4.2, the above procedure will delete the member, but not in Redmine 5.0. This may be due to the difference in the behavior of Member#role_ids = [] (source:trunk/app/models/member.rb@21456#L105) between Redmine 4.2 (Rails 5.2) and Redmine 5.0 (Rails 6.1).

When setting an empty array to Member#role_ids, Redmine 4.2 destroys MemberRole and Member, but Redmine 5.0 only destroys MemberRole. Destroying only MemberRole makes a project member with empty roles.

Redmine 4.2:

```ruby
irb(main):002:0> member.role_ids = []
MemberRole Load (0.2ms)  SELECT "member_roles".* FROM "member_roles" WHERE "member_roles"."member_id" = ?  [["member_id", 17]]
  (0.6ms)  SELECT DISTINCT "roles"."id" FROM "roles" INNER JOIN "member_roles" ON "roles"."id" = "member_roles"."role_id" WHERE "member_roles"."member_id" = ?  [["member_id", 17]]
  (0.1ms)  begin transaction
  MemberRole Destroy (1.2ms)  DELETE FROM "member_roles" WHERE "member_roles"."id" = ?  [["id", 21]]
  Role Exists (0.1ms)  SELECT 1 AS one FROM "roles" INNER JOIN "member_roles" ON "roles"."id" = "member_roles"."role_id" WHERE "member_roles"."member_id" = ? LIMIT ?  [["member_id", 17], ["LIMIT", 1]]
  MemberRole Load (0.1ms)  SELECT "member_roles".* FROM "member_roles" WHERE "member_roles"."member_id" = ?  [["member_id", 17]]
  IssueCategory Update All (1.0ms)  UPDATE "issue_categories" SET assigned_to_id = NULL WHERE (project_id = 1 AND assigned_to_id = 8)
  Project Load (0.7ms)  SELECT "projects".* FROM "projects" WHERE "projects"."id" = ? LIMIT ?  [["id", 1], ["LIMIT", 1]]
  Member Destroy (0.3ms)  DELETE FROM "members" WHERE "members"."id" = ?  [["id", 17]]
  MemberRole Load (0.2ms)  SELECT "member_roles".* FROM "member_roles" WHERE "member_roles"."inherited_from" = ?  [["inherited_from", 21]]
  (2.1ms)  commit transaction
=> []
```

Redmine 5.0:

```ruby
irb(main):011:0> member.role_ids = []
MemberRole Load (0.2ms)  SELECT "member_roles".* FROM "member_roles" WHERE "member_roles"."member_id" = ?  [["member_id", 11]]
  (0.2ms)  SELECT DISTINCT "roles"."id" FROM "roles" INNER JOIN "member_roles" ON "roles"."id" = "member_roles"."role_id" WHERE "member_roles"."member_id" = ?  [["member_id", 11]]
```
Related issues:
Related to Redmine - Defect #38443: Cannot add a user to a group if the group... Closed
Has duplicate Redmine - Defect #37764: Members without any role shouldn't be ... Closed

Associated revisions
Revision 22182 - 2023-04-14 01:34 - Go MAEDA
Roles of a project member should not be made empty (#37166).
Patch by Mizuki ISHIKAWA.

Revision 22183 - 2023-04-14 02:54 - Go MAEDA
Merged r22182 from trunk to 5.0-stable (#37166).

History
#1 - 2022-10-12 05:31 - Go MAEDA
- Has duplicate Defect #37764: Members without any role shouldn't be allowed added

#2 - 2023-04-12 15:37 - Go MAEDA
- Related to Defect #38443: Cannot add a user to a group if the group is a member without roles in a certain project added

#3 - 2023-04-13 04:42 - Mizuki ISHIKAWA
- File fix-37166.patch added
A patch to fix the issue is attached.

#4 - 2023-04-13 04:49 - Go MAEDA
- Target version set to 5.0.6
Setting the target version to 5.0.6.

#5 - 2023-04-14 01:34 - Go MAEDA
- Subject changed from Roles of a project member can be made empty to Roles of a project member should not be made empty
- Status changed from New to Resolved
- Assignee set to Go MAEDA
- Resolution set to Fixed
Committed the patch in r22182.

#6 - 2023-04-14 02:55 - Go MAEDA
- Status changed from Resolved to Closed

Files
member_without_roles.png 69.6 KB 2022-05-27 Go MAEDA
fix-37166.patch 991 Bytes 2023-04-13 Mizuki ISHIKAWA