

## Redmine - Defect #37581

### Wrong csv separator in Hungarian

2022-08-16 11:00 - Attila Telek

<b>Status:</b>	New	<b>Start date:</b>	
<b>Priority:</b>	Normal	<b>Due date:</b>	
<b>Assignee:</b>		<b>% Done:</b>	0%
<b>Category:</b>	Translations	<b>Estimated time:</b>	0.00 hour
<b>Target version:</b>		<b>Affected version:</b>	
<b>Resolution:</b>			
<b>Description</b>			
Hungarian csv separator is semi-colon and decimal separator is comma.			
Latest locale config contains wrong settings for this. <a href="#">root / trunk / config / locales / hu.yml @ 13552</a>			
general_csv_separator: ',' -> ';' general_csv_decimal_sperator: '.' -> ','			
Can you please fix this?			
thank you			

#### History

##### #1 - 2022-08-17 07:56 - Go MAEDA

Can you please provide documentation showing that the current values of general\_csv\_separator and general\_csv\_decimal\_sperator in Hungarian are incorrect?

For example, a CSV file output by the Hungarian version of the spreadsheet software, or web pages or screenshots that contains decimal values.

##### #2 - 2022-08-22 14:30 - Karel Pičman

I think that Attila is right concerning the decimal separator. The most of European countries use comma. Please see [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Decimal\\_separator#Usage\\_worldwide](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Decimal_separator#Usage_worldwide) for reference.

Concerning the csv separator I wouldn't agree. As the name suggests it should be always comma - Comma Separated Values.

##### #3 - 2022-08-22 14:55 - Karel Pičman

- File *general\_csv\_decimal\_separator.patch* added

Here is a patch bringing CSV decimal separators in sync with the wiki page.

##### #4 - 2022-08-22 15:13 - Karel Pičman

- File *number\_format\_separator.patch* added

Update of the numbers' format according to the same rules.

##### #5 - 2022-08-23 09:07 - Karel Pičman

Concerning the number format separator, I have realized after I had changed it to comma, that it is not taken into account in displaying spent and planned hours on tasks. If I set it to comma, the time is still presented with dot. I think that the function `Redmine::I18n.format_hours(hours)` should be changed as follows:

```
def format_hours(hours)
  return "" if hours.blank?

  if Setting.timespan_format == 'minutes'
    h = hours.floor
    m = ((hours - h) * 60).round
    "%d:%02d" % [h, m]
  else
    -- "%02f" % hours.to_f
    ++ sprintf("%.2f", hours.to_f).gsub('.', l(:number_format_separator))
```

```
end
end
```

**#6 - 2022-08-23 09:22 - Karel Pičman**

- File *format\_hours.patch* added

**#7 - 2022-08-23 15:44 - Attila Telek**

- File *regional.png* added

Karel Pičman wrote:

I think that Attila is right concerning the decimal separator. The most of European countries use comma. Please see [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Decimal\\_separator#Usage\\_worldwide](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Decimal_separator#Usage_worldwide) for reference.  
Concerning the csv separator I wouldn't agree. As the name suggests it should be always comma - Comma Separated Values.

Maybe the csv extension has been founded before the regional settings or they didnt find a better name ('Something Separated Values' wouldn't be very professional)  
With a hungarian region, comma separator couldn't be used because it is the decimal separator.

By the way I found that the separator character comes from windows regional settings:  
*regional.png*  
more: <https://www.koskila.net/how-to-change-the-delimiter-when-exporting-csv-from-excel/>

It is deeply integrated to all office applications.

Here is an example csv content saved from my excel:

```
1st col: half;2nd column: Pi
0,5;3,1415
```

**#8 - 2022-08-24 08:08 - Karel Pičman**

With a Hungarian region, comma separator couldn't be used because it is the decimal separator.

If you try to export issues with time entries into CVS in Redmine, you will see that it could:

```
values, "0,5", "3,1415"
```

**#9 - 2022-08-24 16:14 - Attila Telek**

- File *example2.png* added

Karel Pičman wrote:

With a Hungarian region, comma separator couldn't be used because it is the decimal separator.

If you try to export issues with time entries into CVS in Redmine, you will see that it could:

[...]

This could have been a good solution but Microsoft decided to use Windows Regional Settings as the column separator in csv files.  
Excel uses semicolon in Hungary (and in 80 additional countries) and cannot interpret comma separated CSV files.  
I have no info about other spreadsheet softwares but your example export cannot be loaded directly into excel:

example2.png

Maybe Microsoft mis-interpreted the [standard](#) but they are the market leaders so redmine might be adapted to this solution.

**#10 - 2022-08-25 10:13 - Karel Pičman**

- *File `general_csv_separator.patch` added*

So, in order to support Microsoft Office, we should use semicolon as CVS separator, if the decimal separator is comma. Here is a patch.

## Files

---

general_csv_decimal_separator.patch	12.1 KB	2022-08-22	Karel Pičman
number_format_separator.patch	4.9 KB	2022-08-22	Karel Pičman
format_hours.patch	1.11 KB	2022-08-23	Karel Pičman
regional.png	143 KB	2022-08-23	Attila Telek
example2.png	26.4 KB	2022-08-24	Attila Telek
general_csv_separator.patch	10.5 KB	2022-08-25	Karel Pičman