

"Edit this section" on Wiki pages misinterprets issue links with double hash (##nnn) as ATX headings

2024-05-22 05:25 - daijiro fukuda

| | | | |
|-----------------|----------|-------------------|-----------|
| Status: | Closed | Start date: | |
| Priority: | Normal | Due date: | |
| Assignee: | Go MAEDA | % Done: | 0% |
| Category: | Wiki | Estimated time: | 0.00 hour |
| Target version: | 5.1.4 | Affected version: | 5.1.2 |
| Resolution: | Fixed | | |

Description

Abstraction

"Edit this section" in Wiki with the Markdown syntax does not extract [ATX headings](#) correctly.

ATX headings:

```
# Headline
```

```
## Headline
```

The current trunk(rev.22841) and v5.0.2 extracts it by the regexp '#+.', but this would not be sufficient.

Especially, since it does not consider the following condition, it mishandles ticket references such as "#11111" or "##11111".

The opening sequence of # characters must be followed by a space or by the end of line.

I explain the details in "How to reproduce".

How to reproduce

Prepare Wiki with the Markdown syntax as follows.

```
# Wiki
```

```
## Section A
```

```
A
```

```
##1 : this is a ticket reference.
```

```
AA
```

```
## Section B
```

```
B
```

how-to-reproduce-sample1-entire.png

We can click each section's "Edit this section" button (surrounded by red rectangles in the image above). However, we can't edit each section correctly since the ticket reference "##1" is wrongly detected as a level 2 section.

When clicking the button of "Section A":
(URI: "Wiki/edit?section=2")

how-to-reproduce-sample1-edit-section2.png
When clicking the button of "Section B":
(URI: "Wiki/edit?section=3")

how-to-reproduce-sample1-edit-section3.png

The expected result when clicking the button of "Section A":

```
## Section A
```

A

```
##1 : this is a ticket reference.
```

AA

The expected result when clicking the button of "Section B":

```
## Section B
```

B

Environment

```
$ RAILS_ENV=development bin/about
```

Environment:

| | |
|------------------|--|
| Redmine version | 5.1.2.devel |
| Ruby version | 3.2.2-p53 (2023-03-30) [x86_64-linux] |
| Rails version | 7.1.2 |
| Environment | development |
| Database adapter | SQLite |
| Mailer queue | ActiveJob::QueueAdapters::AsyncAdapter |
| Mailer delivery | smtp |

Redmine settings:

| | |
|---------------|---------|
| Redmine theme | Default |
|---------------|---------|

SCM:

| | |
|------------|--------|
| Subversion | 1.13.0 |
| Git | 2.25.1 |
| Filesystem | |

Redmine plugins:

no plugin installed

How should we fix this?

It would be necessary to improve the regular expression based on [GitHub Flavored Markdown](#) (because the commonmarker is wrapping comrak, and comrak is based on GitHub Flavored Markdown.)

The current (rev.22841) regexp for ATX headings is '#+.' as follows.

https://github.com/redmine/redmine/blob/c0af36b12da1d053d87735c174e7c79e97254e75/lib/redmine/wiki_formatting/section_helper.rb#L45

```
@text.split(/^(?:\S|\r?\n\r?(?:\s+|\n+)|#+.+|(?:~~~|```)ate.*\s*$)/).each do |part|
```

https://github.com/redmine/redmine/blob/c0af36b12da1d053d87735c174e7c79e97254e75/lib/redmine/wiki_formatting/section_helper.rb#L55-L56

```
elsif part =~ /\A(#+).+/  
  level = $1.size
```

For example, we can make these conditions consider spaces following the opening '#'.
(I have uploaded this patch file.)

Index: lib/redmine/wiki_formatting/section_helper.rb

```
=====
--- lib/redmine/wiki_formatting/section_helper.rb (revision 22841)
+++ lib/redmine/wiki_formatting/section_helper.rb (working copy)
@@ -42,7 +42,7 @@
     i = 0
```

```
l = 1
inside_pre = false
- @text.split(/(^(?:\S+\r?\n\r?(?:\+=|\-+)|#+.+|(?:~~~|```)*)\s*$)/).each do |part|
+ @text.split(/(^(?:\S+\r?\n\r?(?:\+=|\-+)|#+ +.+|(?:~~~|```)*)\s*$)/).each do |part|
  level = nil
  if part =~ /\A(~{3,}|`{3,}) (\s*\S+)?\s*$/
    if !inside_pre
@@ -52,7 +52,7 @@
      end
      elsif inside_pre
        # nop
-      elsif part =~ /\A(#+).+/
+      elsif part =~ /\A(#+) +.+/
        level = $1.size
      elsif part =~ /\A.+ \r?\n\r?(?:\+=|\-+)\s*$/
        level = $1.include?('=') ? 1 : 2
```

This solves the case I explained in "How to reproduce", but this is not enough to handle the following headlines.

```
# Headline may have some spaces in the line head.

#(\t) Tab can be replaced to spaces
```

I often use ticket references, so I'm happy to solve just the case I explained in "How to reproduce" first.

| | |
|--|--------|
| Related issues: | |
| Has duplicate Redmine - Defect #40715: Wiki (markdown syntax): "Edit this sec... | Closed |

Associated revisions

- Revision 22905 - 2024-07-06 09:35 - Go MAEDA**
Fix RuboCop offense Style/RedundantRegexpEscape in lib/redmine/wiki_formatting/section_helper.rb (#40716).
- Revision 22906 - 2024-07-06 09:44 - Go MAEDA**
Prevent issue links with double hash (##nnn) from being recognized as ATX headings (#40716).
Patch by daijiro fukuda (user:daipom).
- Revision 22907 - 2024-07-06 09:46 - Go MAEDA**
Add test for r22906 (#40716).
- Revision 22918 - 2024-07-10 11:33 - Go MAEDA**
Merged r22905, r22906, and r22907 from trunk to 5.1-stable (#40716).

History

#1 - 2024-05-22 05:32 - daijiro fukuda
I have confirmed the following with the uploaded patch: wiki-fix-section-extracting-mishandles-ticket-refs.diff.

- the case described in "How to reproduce" is resolved
- No failure in the tests

My view on the fix is as explained in "How should we fix this?".
If you think a more drastic fix is needed, please point it out.
Thanks!

#2 - 2024-05-22 08:38 - Marius BĂLTEANU
- Has duplicate Defect #40715: Wiki (markdown syntax): "Edit this section" does not extract ATX headings correctly added

#3 - 2024-05-22 11:38 - Go MAEDA
- Status changed from New to Confirmed

#4 - 2024-06-27 11:48 - Mark Asbach
daijiro fukuda wrote in [#note-1](#):

If you think a more drastic fix is needed, please point it out.

I've stumbled upon this issue as we experience a (most probably) related issue, but for setext Headings in Markdown (<https://github.com/gfm/#setext-heading>). Because I'm not 100% sure this is the same root cause, I've created a new ticket ([#40918](#)), but if my assumption is right, a more drastic fix would be good to solve both issues.

Unfortunately, I'm no rails developer and so cannot provide a patch or pull request with sufficient quality. In case you find the time to look at the issue reported by me, I'd be very grateful for that.

Thanks!

#5 - 2024-07-04 08:28 - Go MAEDA

- File `test-40716.patch` added
- Target version set to 5.1.4

Thank you for posting the patch to fix the issue. I wrote a test for the patch.

Setting the target version to 5.1.4.

#6 - 2024-07-06 09:49 - Go MAEDA

- Subject changed from Wiki (markdown syntax): "Edit this section" does not extract ATX headings correctly to "Edit this section" on Wiki pages misinterprets issue links with double hash (`##nnn`) as ATX headings
- Status changed from Confirmed to Resolved
- Assignee set to Go MAEDA
- Resolution set to Fixed

Committed the patch in [r22906](#).
Thank you for your contribution.

#7 - 2024-07-10 11:34 - Go MAEDA

- Status changed from Resolved to Closed

Merged the changes to 5.1-stable in [r22918](#).

#8 - 2024-07-10 11:38 - daijiro fukuda

Thanks for merging!

About [Defect #40918: Wiki \(markdown syntax\): "Edit this section" does not extract SeText headings correctly \(#note-4\)](#), I'll take a look if I have time.

| Files | | | |
|---|-----------|------------|----------------|
| how-to-reproduce-sample1-edit-section3.png | 14.6 KB | 2024-05-22 | daijiro fukuda |
| how-to-reproduce-sample1-edit-section2.png | 14 KB | 2024-05-22 | daijiro fukuda |
| how-to-reproduce-sample1-entire.png | 50.1 KB | 2024-05-22 | daijiro fukuda |
| wiki-fix-section-extracting-mishandles-ticket-refs.diff | 903 Bytes | 2024-05-22 | daijiro fukuda |
| test-40716.patch | 1.03 KB | 2024-07-04 | Go MAEDA |