

Redmine - Patch #40939

Add "underline" button to jsToolbar for CommonMark Markdown formatting

2024-07-06 14:08 - Yasu Saku

Status:	Closed	Start date:	
Priority:	Normal	Due date:	
Assignee:	Go MAEDA	% Done:	0%
Category:	Text formatting	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:	6.0.0		
<div>Description</div> <div>The Textile and Markdown text formatting have an "underline" button in the jsToolbar. However, the CommonMark Markdown text format does not.</div> <div>Also, CommonMark Markdown supports HTML tags. So I created a patch to insert `<ins></ins>` tags.</ins></div>			
<div>Related issues:</div> <div>Blocks Redmine - Feature #40149: Drop deprecated Redcarpet based Markdown for...<div>Closed</div></div>			

Associated revisions

Revision 23106 - 2024-10-09 16:04 - Go MAEDA

Add underline button to CommonMark Markdown toolbar (#40939).

Contributed by Yasu Saku (user:skys).

Revision 23160 - 2024-10-24 08:14 - Go MAEDA

Fix failing system test for keyboard shortcuts to reflect CommonMark toolbar's output (#40149, #40939).

Patch by Mizuki ISHIKAWA (user:ishikawa999).

History

#1 - 2024-07-07 07:55 - Go MAEDA

- File 40939-v2.patch added

Thank you for the proposal to add an "Underline" button to the CommonMark Markdown toolbar.

However, I think it is better to use <u> instead of <ins>, as in Redcarpet-based Markdown. This is because <ins> is semantically intended to represent inserted text, so using <ins> only to express underline is not semantically appropriate.

I have updated the patch to use the <u> element accordingly.

#2 - 2024-07-07 09:30 - Yasu Saku

Go MAEDA wrote in [#note-1](#):

Thank you for the proposal to add an "Underline" button to the CommonMark Markdown toolbar.

However, I think it is better to use <u> instead of <ins>, as in Redcarpet-based Markdown. This is because <ins> is semantically intended to represent inserted text, so using <ins> only to express underline is not semantically appropriate.

I have updated the patch to use the <u> element accordingly.

Thank you for the correction and explanation.

But, I am a little concerned about the `ins` in the comments, including other text formatting. Why?

#3 - 2024-07-18 11:54 - Go MAEDA

I investigated why the comment // ins is used for the "Underline" button in markdown.js.

First, in Textile, which was the only available formatter before Redcarpet-based Markdown was implemented in Redmine 2.5.0, the <ins> tag is used to represent underlined text. Therefore, it makes sense for the comment // ins to be used for the "Underline" button in textile.js ([source:trunk/app/assets/javascripts/jstoolbar/textile.js@22937#L29](#)).

However, in Markdown based on Redcarpet, the `<u>` tag is used for underlined text. Despite this, the comment in markdown.js still says `// ins` ([source:trunk/app/assets/javascripts/jstoolbar/markdown.js@22937#L29](https://source.trunk/app/assets/javascripts/jstoolbar/markdown.js@22937#L29)). It would be more appropriate for it to say `// u`. It is likely that when the underline button was added to the Markdown toolbar in [r17385](#), the comment `// ins` from textile.js was copied over without being changed.

Therefore, I suggest proceeding as follows:

- For the CommonMark Markdown toolbar, follow the implementation of Redcarpet-based Markdown and use the `<u>` tag to represent underlined text, as I proposed in [40939-v2.patch](#).
- Change the comment `// ins` in [40939-v2.patch](#) to `// u`.
- Change the existing comments in markdown.js to `// u` to match the HTML output by Redcarpet.

#4 - 2024-07-19 10:03 - Go MAEDA

- File 0001-Change-comment-to-u-for-Underline-button.patch added

- File 0002-Add-Underline-button-to-jsToolBar-for-CommonMark-Mar.patch added

Following the proposal made in [#note-3](#), I have updated the patches.

1. The first patch corrects the comment in the Redcarpet-based Markdown underline button code to `// u`. This is because the final output HTML uses the `<u>` tag to achieve the underline effect.
2. The second patch adds an underline button to the CommonMark Markdown toolbar. This is a slightly modified version of the patch provided by Yasu Saku.

#5 - 2024-07-20 03:01 - Go MAEDA

- Target version set to 6.0.0

Setting the target version to 6.0.0.

#6 - 2024-07-20 08:45 - Yasu Saku

Thank you Mr. [Go MAEDA](#).

I have understood the historical context in which the `//ins` comment was added.

In addition, I think it would be better to change `jsToolBar.prototype.elements.ins` to `jsToolBar.prototype.elements.u`.

What do you think?

```
diff --git a/app/assets/javascripts/jstoolbar/common_mark.js b/app/assets/javascripts/jstoolbar/common_mark.js
index f9e5ba7..5c3627a 100644
--- a/app/assets/javascripts/jstoolbar/common_mark.js
+++ b/app/assets/javascripts/jstoolbar/common_mark.js
@@ -26,6 +26,16 @@ jsToolBar.prototype.elements.em = {
 }
 }

+// u
+jsToolBar.prototype.elements.u = {
+  type: 'button',
+  title: 'Underline',
+  shortcut: 'u',
+  fn: {
+    wiki: function() { this.singleTag('<u>', '</u>') }
+  }
+}
+
// del
jsToolBar.prototype.elements.del = {
  type: 'button',
diff --git a/app/assets/stylesheets/jstoolbar.css b/app/assets/stylesheets/jstoolbar.css
index 6870261..38c70c1 100644
--- a/app/assets/stylesheets/jstoolbar.css
+++ b/app/assets/stylesheets/jstoolbar.css
@@ -113,6 +113,9 @@
.jstb_ins {
  background-image: url(/jstoolbar/bt_ins.png);
}
+.jstb_u {
+  background-image: url(/jstoolbar/bt_ins.png);
+}
.jstb_del {
  background-image: url(/jstoolbar/bt_del.png);
}
```

#7 - 2024-10-08 11:34 - Go MAEDA

Yasu Saku wrote in [#note-6](#):

In addition, I think it would be better to change jsToolBar.prototype.elements.ins to jsToolBar.prototype.elements.u.

To make that change, probably we need to change textile.js as well as jstoolbar.css. I am not willing to change so many files for a simple change of adding a single button to the CommonMark Markdown toolbar.

#8 - 2024-10-09 00:49 - Yasu Saku

Go MAEDA wrote in [#note-7](#):

To make that change, probably we need to change textile.js as well as jstoolbar.css. I am not willing to change so many files for a simple change of adding a single button to the CommonMark Markdown toolbar.

Thank you for your opinion. Understood. I appreciate your assistance.

#9 - 2024-10-09 11:30 - Go MAEDA

- Blocks Feature #40149: Drop deprecated Redcarpet based Markdown formatter added

#10 - 2024-10-09 16:10 - Go MAEDA

- Status changed from New to Closed

- Assignee set to Go MAEDA

Committed the patch in [r23106](#).

The CommonMark toolbar now includes an underline button, the same as the toolbars for Textile and Redcarpet-based Markdown.

#11 - 2024-10-24 07:59 - Mizuki ISHIKAWA

The InlineAutocompleteSystemTest#test_keyboard_shortcuts_for_wiki_toolbar_buttons_using_markdown test is failing because the system test expectation has not been changed.
I would like to see the expected value changed to “<u></u>” as follows.

```
diff --git a/test/system/keyboard_shortcuts_test.rb b/test/system/keyboard_shortcuts_test.rb
index 32f5dbe56..361326be1 100644
--- a/test/system/keyboard_shortcuts_test.rb
+++ b/test/system/keyboard_shortcuts_test.rb
@@ -100,7 +100,7 @@ class InlineAutocompleteSystemTest < ApplicationSystemTestCase
   # Clear textarea value
   fill_in 'Description', :with => ''
   find('#issue_description').send_keys([modifier_key, 'u'])
-  assert_equal '__', find('#issue_description').value
+  assert_equal '<u></u>', find('#issue_description').value

   # Clear textarea value
   fill_in 'Description', :with => ''
```

#12 - 2024-10-24 08:15 - Go MAEDA

Mizuki ISHIKAWA wrote in [#note-11](#):

The InlineAutocompleteSystemTest#test_keyboard_shortcuts_for_wiki_toolbar_buttons_using_markdown test is failing because the system test expectation has not been changed.
I would like to see the expected value changed to “<u></u>” as follows.

[...]

Committed the fix in [r23160](#). Thank you for catching and fixing the test failure.

Files

patch.diff	568 Bytes	2024-07-06	Yasu Saku
40939-v2.patch	1.06 KB	2024-07-07	Go MAEDA
0001-Change-comment-to-u-for-Underline-button.patch	907 Bytes	2024-07-19	Go MAEDA
0002-Add-Underline-button-to-jsToolBar-for-CommonMark-Mar.patch	1.47 KB	2024-07-19	Go MAEDA