

Redmine - Defect #8093

Incoming email with internal emails as attachments isn't processed properly

2011-04-07 09:35 - Sergey Prosin

Status:	New	Start date:	2011-04-07
Priority:	Normal	Due date:	
Assignee:		% Done:	0%
Category:	Email receiving	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:		Affected version:	1.1.2
Resolution:			
Description			
Our remine system checks email account regularly for new emails. If we send any email to special address system processes it very good, but if we send an email with other email inside (we use MS Outlook feature "Send as attachment" for emails) then the email will be processed incorrectly and there won't be any attachments inside created issue. Obviously this is some special case in processing.			
Related issues:			
Related to Redmine - Defect #15793: Problems with recieving emails with attac...		Closed	
Is duplicate of Redmine - Defect #5994: Creating new issue via email submissi...		New	2010-07-29

History

#1 - 2011-04-12 09:32 - Sergey Prosin

Any thoughts how to fix or check it?

#2 - 2011-04-12 10:50 - Etienne Massip

Could you please post the most simple / light test mail which fail to be processed by Redmine so that the issue can be reproduced it easily ?

#3 - 2011-04-12 11:43 - Sergey Prosin

- File *This_is_an_issue_title.msg* added

- File *This_is_an_issue_title__unicode_.msg* added

Sure. This are 2 msg files of the message: one just in Unicode format.

#4 - 2011-04-13 11:02 - Sergey Prosin

- File *This_is_an_issue_title.eml* added

Unfortunately, outlook doesn't have built-in capabilities for saving emails as emls.

I've converted the email to eml format with some external tool. I'm not sure if it is the same content as processed by the receiver (We use "rake redmine:email:receive_pop3" approach). Is there any way to catch exactly the same content? (Say, extended information in log or something else)

#5 - 2011-04-19 13:33 - Sergey Prosin

Hi, any update about the issue?

Can I help with it?

#6 - 2011-05-30 09:53 - Etienne Massip

Actually, it's a duplicate of [#5994](#) but I keep it open since there is more details.

#7 - 2012-08-22 08:12 - Joel Thompson

- File *msgToEml.patch* added

I spent half the day learning ruby so I could fix this today. So I have uploaded the patch that I came up with for Redmine 1.3.3 but I made this patch to work with the latest in the git repo.

It's really simple because Tmail has already converted the attachment object to EML and saves it to Redmine as "noname" so windows cannot open the file, I tried manually opening it with outlook and adding .msg to the file but no go. Then I looked up the code where it is saving the attachments and made it write it directly to the file system, then I found that it is already an EML. So all this patch does is if the attachment meets the 'message/rfc822' content type requirement then I name the file attachment.eml before it saves it to Redmine. I have also tried sending attachments

inside an email attached as an attachment and it all comes through fine.

The patch is for app/models/mail_handler.rb.

#8 - 2012-08-22 10:01 - Sergey Prosin

Unfortunately, that doesn't help in any way. After some tests we discovered that the internal email in this case doesn't look like attachment at least system think so.

We used this code for check (mail_handler.rb)

```
-----  
def add_attachments(obj)  
  if email.has_attachments?  
    email.attachments.each_with_index do |attachment, i|  
      print "attachment.content_type = "  
      print attachment.content_type  
    end  
  end  
end  
-----
```

and there wasn't any output like attachment.content_type = smth

I should also say that in our case there is no noname file in Redmine after email was processed.

To sum that, I think the problem is that ruby mechanisms can't understand the structure of such kind of emails. And that is very sad.

Looking forward to hearing from you, Joel.

#9 - 2012-08-29 02:27 - Joel Thompson

Hmm, interesting.

I'm afraid I cannot help with that one, as the attachments are coming through but Redmine just didn't know how to handle them.

Keep in mind I am using 1.3.3 here, and Redmine uses [Tmail](#) for the mail handling.

So you are using an older version which cannot handle the Outlook .msg files at all?

#10 - 2012-09-03 09:40 - Sergey Prosin

As I said we are using Redmine 1.1.2. May be there is a simple script which we can use for discovering our issues nature?

This is the list of gems we have:

- actionmailer (3.2.8, 2.3.14, 2.3.5, 2.3.2)
- actionpack (3.2.8, 2.3.14, 2.3.5, 2.3.2)
- activemodel (3.2.8)
- activerecord (3.2.8, 2.3.14, 2.3.5, 2.3.2)
- activerecord-mysql2-adapter (0.0.3)
- activeresource (3.2.8, 2.3.14, 2.3.5, 2.3.2)
- activesupport (3.2.8, 2.3.14, 2.3.5, 2.3.2)
- allison (2.0.3)
- arel (3.0.2)
- builder (3.0.0)
- bundler (1.1.5)
- cgi_multipart_eof_fix (2.5.0)
- coderay (1.0.7)
- daemons (1.1.9, 1.0.10)
- echoe (3.1.1)
- erubis (2.7.0)
- fastercsv (1.5.5)
- fastthread (1.0.1 i386-mswin32)
- fiveruns_tuneup (0.8.20)
- gem_plugin (0.2.3)
- gemcutter (0.7.1)
- highline (1.6.13, 1.5.1)
- hike (1.2.1)
- hoe (3.0.8)
- i18n (0.6.0, 0.5.0, 0.4.2)
- journey (1.0.4)
- json_pure (1.7.5)
- mail (2.4.4)
- mime-types (1.19)
- mongrel (1.1.5 x86-mswin32-60)
- mongrel_service (0.3.4 i386-mswin32)
- multi_json (1.3.6)
- mysql (2.8.1 x86-mswin32, 2.7.3 mswin32)
- mysql2 (0.3.11 x86-mswin32-60)
- net-ldap (0.3.1)
- pik (0.2.8)

polyglot (0.3.3)
rack (1.4.1, 1.1.3, 1.0.1)
rack-cache (1.2)
rack-ssl (1.3.2)
rack-test (0.6.1)
rails (2.3.14, 2.3.5, 2.3.2)
rake (0.9.2.2, 0.8.7)
rmagick (2.10.0 mswin32)
ruby-openid (2.2.0, 2.1.8)
rubyforge (2.0.4, 1.0.3)
sprockets (2.1.3)
sqlite3 (1.3.6 x86-mswin32-60)
sqlite3-ruby (1.2.3 mswin32)
thor (0.16.0)
tilt (1.3.3)
treetop (1.4.10)
tzinfo (0.3.33)
win32-service (0.5.2 mswin32)

Any ideas, Joel?

#11 - 2013-01-23 06:47 - Sergey Prosin

Hi again. We've just migrated to latest redmine version (2.2.0 to the moment). The issue is still here. So obviously that wasn't related with old redmine version we used before update.

Current list of gems:

actionmailer (3.2.11)
actionpack (3.2.11)
activemodel (3.2.11)
activerecord (3.2.11)
activeresource (3.2.11)
activesupport (3.2.11)
ansi (1.4.3)
arel (3.0.2)
aws-sdk (1.6.9)
bcrypt-ruby (3.0.1 x86-mingw32)
bigdecimal (1.1.0)
bluecloth (2.1.0 x86-mingw32)
builder (3.0.0)
bundler (1.2.3, 1.0.21)
coderay (1.0.6)
coffee-rails (3.2.2)
coffee-script (2.2.0)
coffee-script-source (1.3.3)
crack (0.3.1)
daemons (1.1.8)
diff-lcs (1.1.3)
erubis (2.7.0)
eventmachine (1.0.0 x86-mingw32)
execjs (1.4.0)
fastercsv (1.5.4)
hike (1.2.1)
hoe (3.0.6)
httparty (0.8.3)
i18n (0.6.0)
io-console (0.3)
journey (1.0.4)
jquery-rails (2.1.3, 2.0.3)
json (1.5.4)
mail (2.4.4)
metaclass (0.0.1)
mime-types (1.19, 1.18)
mini_magick (3.4)
mini_portile (0.3.0)
minitest (2.5.1)
mocha (0.12.3)
multi_json (1.3.6)
multi_xml (0.5.1)
mustache (0.99.4)
mysql2 (0.3.11 x86-mingw32, 0.2.18)
net-ldap (0.3.1)
nokogiri (1.5.5 x86-mingw32, 1.4.7 x86-mingw32)
polyglot (0.3.3)
prototype-rails (3.2.1)
rack (1.4.1)

rack-cache (1.2)
rack-mount (0.8.3)
rack-openid (1.3.1)
rack-ssl (1.3.2)
rack-test (0.6.1)
rails (3.2.11)
railties (3.2.11)
rake (0.9.2.2)
rake-compiler (0.8.1)
rdoc (3.12, 3.9.4)
RedCloth (4.2.9 x86-mingw32)
rmagick (2.13.1)
rspec (2.11.0)
rspec-core (2.11.1)
rspec-expectations (2.11.2)
rspec-mocks (2.11.1)
ruby-openid (2.1.8)
rubygems-update (1.8.24)
rvm (1.11.3.5)
sass (3.1.20)
sass-rails (3.2.5)
sprockets (2.4.5, 2.2.1, 2.1.3, 2.1.2)
sqlite3 (1.3.6 x86-mingw32)
sqlite3-ruby (1.3.2 x86-mingw32)
subexec (0.2.2)
test-unit (2.5.2)
thin (1.3.1)
thor (0.15.4, 0.14.6)
tilt (1.3.3)
treetop (1.4.10)
turn (0.9.6)
tzinfo (0.3.33)
uglifier (1.2.6)
uuidtools (2.1.3)
yard (0.8.1)

#12 - 2013-01-28 07:03 - Sergey Prosin

- *File outlook_attachment.diff added*

Hi! Finally we've been able to deal with this issue. The problem was this kind of attachments in emails generated by outlook was stored not like attachment but as part of multipart message with the following header

```
-----=_NextPart_000_01C9_01CDF973.EB5E8D50  
Content-Type: message/rfc822  
Content-Transfer-Encoding: 7bit  
Content-Disposition: attachment
```

We've created special patch for this case (attached)

I'm not an expert in ruby so that is obviously not a state of the art piece of code and I would be honored if someone would rewrite this to follow ruby, RoR, and Redmine guidelines.

Also that would be great if this code after revision will be added in Redmine core.

#13 - 2014-01-02 09:37 - Evgeniy Cn

Bug still exists, checked on 2.3.1 stable, solution above doesn't work, any ideas how to fix it ?

Thank you.

#14 - 2014-01-02 13:54 - Daniel Felix

- *Related to Defect #15793: Problems with receiving emails with attached .msg files added*

#15 - 2014-01-03 15:20 - Jean-Philippe Lang

- *File issue.png added*

I've just made a quick test with the attached sample email `This_is_an_issue_title.eml` and it works fine. The issue is created with the test email as attachment, see below. Could you attach the content of your email for which it doesn't work?

This is an issue title

Ajouté par Anonyme il y a moins d'une minute.

Statut: New
Priorité: Normal
Assigné à: -
Catégorie: -
Version cible: -
Affected version:
Resolution:
Texte:

Description

This is an issue description

 test email (2,707 ko)  Anonyme, 03/01/2014 21:15

#16 - 2014-10-15 23:15 - Björn Lässig

I just ran in the same error. After analyzing:

It is not a question which attachment you attach. The Question is how.
Look at the raw text of your Mails. If you attach with this, the attachment is ignored by redmine.

```
--GPJrCs/72TxItFYR
Content-Type: message/rfc822
Content-Disposition: inline
Content-Transfer-Encoding: 8bit
```

```
Return-path: <bla@nix>
[...some mail...]
```

If you use this (with a name option), the attachment will be attached to your ticket.

```
--GPJrCs/72TxItFYR
Content-Type: message/rfc822
  name="withname.eml"
Content-Disposition: inline
Content-Transfer-Encoding: 8bit
```

```
Return-path: <bla@nix>
[...some mail...]
```

my Details:
Redmine version 2.5.2.stable
Ruby version 1.9.3-p194 (2012-04-20) [x86_64-linux]

#17 - 2015-04-16 11:06 - Dennis Buehring

Sergeys patch worked for me with a minor change, because part.content_disposition does not just contain "attachment" but a longer string...

Example:

```
#<Mail::Part:32266040, Multipart: false, Headers: <Content-Type: message/rfc822>, <Content-Transfer-Encoding: 7bit>, <Content-Disposition: attachment; creation-date="Thu, 16 Apr 2015 07:32:25 GMT"; modification-date="Thu, 16 Apr 2015 07:32:25 GMT">>
```

This is the modified block from Sergeys patch:

```
logger.info "Checking multipart"
if email.parts
  email.parts.each do |part|
    p part.content_disposition
    if part.content_disposition =~ /attachment/i
      logger.info "Found email attachment in parts section"
      contents = part.decoded.gsub(0x0a.chr, 0x0d.chr+0x0a.chr) # this is to change newline type in attachment
      logger.info "Trying to parse it as email"
      attachment_email = Mail.new(contents)
      p attachment_email
      obj.attachments << Attachment.create(:container => obj,
```

```
      :file => contents,
      :filename => attachment_email.subject + ".eml",
      :author => user,
      :content_type => part.content_type)
  logger.info "Attachment added"
end
end
end
logger.info "Attachments added"
```

#18 - 2015-05-15 19:15 - Toshi MARUYAMA

Sergey Prosin wrote:

Hi! Finally we've been able to deal with this issue. The problem was this kind of attachments in emails generated by outlook was stored not like attachment but as part of multipart message with the following header

```
-----=_NextPart_000_01C9_01CDF973.EB5E8D50
Content-Type: message/rfc822
Content-Transfer-Encoding: 7bit
Content-Disposition: attachment
```

We've created special patch for this case (attached)

I'm not an expert in ruby so that is obviously not a state of the art piece of code and I would be honored if someone would rewrite this to follow ruby, RoR, and Redmine guidelines.

Also that would be great if this code after revision will be added in Redmine core.

I think it should be fixed by mail gem.

<https://github.com/mikel/mail/issues/851>

#19 - 2017-04-13 16:48 - Library Systems Dept

For what it is worth, I don't think this has ever worked for us.

Every 'Forward as Attachment' email that Redmine has touched only had the body text included in the resulting issue, not the attachments. We use Microsoft Exchange as the mail server and Microsoft Outlook as the email client. The oldest version we have installed is Outlook 2010, but later installations are all 2016. We've tested with Outlook 2010, 2013 and 2016, all with the same results.

We generally run the latest Redmine release version. Details for our installation:

bin/about

```
sh: 1: darcs: not found
sh: 1: hg: not found
sh: 1: cvs: not found
sh: 1: bazaar: not found
sh: 1: git: not found
Environment:
  Redmine version      3.3.3.stable.16539
  Ruby version         2.3.1-p112 (2016-04-26) [x86_64-linux-gnu]
  Rails version        4.2.7.1
  Environment          production
  Database adapter     Mysql2
SCM:
  Subversion           1.9.3
  Filesystem
Redmine plugins:
  no plugin installed
```

bundle list

```
Gems included by the bundle:
* actionmailer (4.2.7.1)
* actionpack (4.2.7.1)
* actionpack-action_caching (1.1.1)
* actionpack-xml_parser (1.0.2)
* actionview (4.2.7.1)
* activejob (4.2.7.1)
* activemodel (4.2.7.1)
* activerecord (4.2.7.1)
* activesupport (4.2.7.1)
```

```
* addressable (2.4.0)
* arel (6.0.3)
* builder (3.2.2)
* bundler (1.11.2)
* coderay (1.1.1)
* concurrent-ruby (1.0.2)
* css_parser (1.4.5)
* erubis (2.7.0)
* globalid (0.3.7)
* htmlentities (4.3.4)
* i18n (0.7.0)
* jquery-rails (3.1.4)
* json (1.8.3)
* loofah (2.0.3)
* mail (2.6.4)
* mime-types (3.1)
* mime-types-data (3.2016.0521)
* mimemagic (0.3.2)
* mini_portile2 (2.1.0)
* minitest (5.9.1)
* mysql2 (0.3.21)
* net-ldap (0.12.1)
* nokogiri (1.6.8.1)
* protected_attributes (1.1.3)
* rack (1.6.4)
* rack-openid (1.4.2)
* rack-test (0.6.3)
* rails (4.2.7.1)
* rails-deprecated_sanitizer (1.0.3)
* rails-dom-testing (1.0.7)
* rails-html-sanitizer (1.0.3)
* railties (4.2.7.1)
* rake (11.3.0)
* rbpdf (1.19.2)
* rbpdf-font (1.19.1)
* rdoc (4.3.0)
* redcarpet (3.3.4)
* request_store (1.0.5)
* rmagick (2.16.0)
* roadie (3.2.0)
* roadie-rails (1.1.1)
* ruby-openid (2.3.0)
* sprockets (3.7.0)
* sprockets-rails (3.2.0)
* thor (0.19.1)
* thread_safe (0.3.5)
* tzinfo (1.2.2)
* yard (0.9.5)
```

#20 - 2021-04-15 08:43 - David Doležal

I tested this on 4.1.1 stable and still is a problem. In my situation Redmine reject incoming email. No new issue, no new issue answer.

#21 - 2022-06-22 12:19 - Jan Catrysse

This indeed still an issue on Redmine 4.2.3.stable.

Sending a message to Redmine, from Outlook 2019 with a .msg file attached (a mail as attachment) does not work.

It seems the mail is parsed as a message and not as an attachment. This is blocking because we have a rule, removing everything after the first horizontal line.

Hence, the reason we are sending (customer) mails as an attachment.

The patch is not working because `app\models\mail_handler.rb` has changed completely.

Could someone point me in a direction, where and how the attachments are handled now?

#22 - 2022-06-22 16:56 - Jan Catrysse

- *File Add_function_to_extract_Outlook_msg_attachments_and_handle_them_correctly_as_attachments_patch added*

I was able to fix this on a very dirty way, with the code from above... but this should be cleaned up by someone more proficient.

I am adding a patch file for Redmine 4.2.3.

I added this code to app/models/mail_handler.rb at the top of the add_attachments method.

```
logger.info "Checking multipart"
if email.parts
  email.parts.each do |part|
    if (part.content_disposition =~ /attachment/i) && (part.content_type = "message/rfc822")
      logger.info "Found email attachment in parts section"
      contents = part.decoded.gsub(0x0a.chr, 0x0d.chr+0x0a.chr)
# this is to change newline type in attachment
      logger.info "Trying to parse it as email"
      attachment_email = Mail.new(contents)
      obj.attachments << Attachment.create(:container => obj,
                                           :file => contents,
                                           :filename => attachment_email.subject + ".eml",
                                           :author => user,
                                           :content_type => part.content_type)

      logger.info "Attachment added"
    end
  end
end
end
logger.info "Attachments added"
```

I really hope someone could help to add this in a more neat way.

#23 - 2022-06-22 22:44 - Jan Catrysse

This is a link to a probable fix for the mail gem, maybe it helps:

<https://github.com/mikel/mail/pull/1389/commits/c0dfe57ef74bbcd8c54ed06abb28f29aba9d5d19>

File: lib/mail/attachments_list.rb

```
@@ -7,7 +7,9 @@ def initialize(parts_list)
  @content_disposition_type = 'attachment'
  parts_list.map { |p|
    if p.mime_type == 'message/rfc822'
-     Mail.new(p.body.encoded).attachments
+     parts = []
+     parts << p if p.attachment?
+     parts.concat Mail.new(p.body.encoded).attachments
    elsif p.parts.empty?
      p if p.attachment?
    else
```

Files

letter_example.png	50.6 KB	2011-04-07	Sergey Prosin
This_is_an_issue_title.msg	32.5 KB	2011-04-12	Sergey Prosin
This_is_an_issue_title__unicode_.msg	34 KB	2011-04-12	Sergey Prosin
This_is_an_issue_title.eml	5.89 KB	2011-04-13	Sergey Prosin
msgToEml.patch	1.22 KB	2012-08-22	Joel Thompson
outlook_attachment.diff	1.12 KB	2013-01-28	Sergey Prosin
issue.png	5.86 KB	2014-01-03	Jean-Philippe Lang
Add_function_to_extract_Outlook_msg_attachments_and_handle_them_correctly_as_attachments_patch	1.58 KB	2022-06-22	Jan Catrysse